The Emendation of A Shi'ite Creed

Author(s): Shaykh al-Mufid

Translator(s): Irfan 'Abdu l-Hamid

بسم الله الرحمن الرحیم

The Emendation of A Shi‘ite Creed

:Writer

Shaykh al–Mufid

:Published in print

World Organization for Islamic services

:Digital Publisher

Ghaemiyeh center of computerized researches

Contents

The Emendation of A Shi‘ite Creed

BOOK ID

Author(s): Shaykh al-Mufid

Translator(s): Irfan ‘Abdu l-Hamid

(Publisher(s): World Organization for Islamic Services (WOFIS

Category: General

Topic Tags: Shiite Creed

Featured Category: Resources for Further Research

point

This text is a translation of Tashihu 'l-I‘tiqad of Abu ‘Abdillah, Muhammad ibn (Muhammad ibn Nu‘man, Known as ash-Shaykh al-Mufid (۳۳۶/۹۴۸ or ۳۳۸/۹۵۰ – ۴۱۳/۱۰۲۲

Preface

The intellectual relationship between the Mu‘tazilite school of thought and Shi‘ism, which constitutes, as the late Prof. Macdonald noticed, "the great mystery of Muslim history", was referred to by many classical as well as modern scholars. The different opinions expressed by them on this complicated subject can be reduced to two .theories

Those who maintain that Shi‘ism has elaborated its theology on a basis borrowed from the intellectual system of the Mu‘tazilites, to which the Shi‘ah divines affiliated themselves during the fourth century of the Hijra. This theory seems to be very old in origin, since as early as the fourth century some, such as ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, wrote a refutation of it. Among the Sunnite theologians ash-Shahrastani, Ibn Taymiyyah and ad-Dawani supported it. Recently both Goldziher and Adam Mez have also .championed it

Contrary to this is the theory advanced by the Shi'ite theologians themselves who resented the whole aspersion of borrowing, and were engaged in intellectual controversies in an effort to repudiate it, directing their fiercest attacks against this so-called "false allegation". They were not content with this negative refutation but also alleged that the whole Mu'tazilite system was itself a product of the teachings of

the infallible Imams, which were transfused into Mu'tazilite philosophy through the tuition which the early Mu'tazilite doctor, and the founder of the whole school, Wasil ibn 'Ata' received from Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyyah. (۱)

It is easy in this respect to explain and comprehend the concern of the Shi'ah divines on the grounds that to them the whole structure of their authoritative system was based on and indeed derived from the direct intuition which the infallible received from God without any extraneous support.

Nevertheless, a critical investigation based on comparative research will soon disclose that the transformation of the Shi'ite theology from a literal, traditional stand to a rational and allegorical interpretation of the revealed law, was primarily inspired by critical and rational Mu'tazilite tendencies.

I am convinced that a critical comparison of the Imamiyyah Creed as stated for the first time by Ibn Babawayh al- Qummi in his 'Aqaidu 'l-Imamiyyah, with Tashih I'tiqadati 'l- Imamiyyah which was compiled by his pupil Abu 'Abdillah ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, which is the core of my thesis, will demonstrate that the reconstruction, refinement and reexamination which is visible in al-Mufid's work, marked a new orientation towards a critical methodology first inaugurated by the Mu'tazilite. Hence it is essential that my work should be studied along with Prof. A.A.A. Fyzee's A Shi'ite Creed.

My thesis, as it stands, consists of three parts. In Part One, I have dealt with the author, his works and the times in which he lived, since it is my opinion that the Buwayhid regime in

---

۱- This relationship though referred to frequently (see Ibnu 'l-Murtada, al- Munyah, p.۵), is not admissible since Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyyah died in ۷۹ or ۸۰ AH, the very year in which Wasil was born. Some sources substitute Abu Hashim 'Abdullah, the son of Muhammad Ibn al-Hanafiyyah for his father (ash-Shahristani, al-Milal, vol.۱, p۵۷). Even, if this were so, the personal relationship should not be stressed too far; as it

.would be rash to assume their teachings are necessarily similar

which he lived, provided a milieu in which Mu'tazilite teachings permeated Shi'ite theology. I have prepared a complete list of his works, published, extant in manuscript, and unknown to us except by name, to show the position which he enjoyed and the important role he played in Shi'ite thought. I was very lucky in my visit to an-Najaf, al-Kazimayn and Karbala', where I found many valuable .manuscripts not recorded in the standard catalogues

In Part Two I have prepared a critical translation of Tashih I'tiqadati 'l-Imamiyyah, with amendments and notes. I have based my translation on the published text which is based in turn on three different manuscripts. I have made use of a fourth copy .which exists at the India Office Library under the number ۲۰۵۷

I have referred to them respectively by the letters (T) for the published text, and (N) for the India Office manuscript. In Part Three, I have commented on a selection of topics relevant to my thesis. In some cases detailed and somewhat lengthy explanations were unavoidable so that the different stands of the various schools should be made clear and their inter-relations and mutual impact easily discerned. :Three general observations also are to be noticed

a) I have restricted my research to the intellectual relationship between the Mu'tazilite school of thought and the Ithna'Ashariyyah school of the Shi'ah; thus .wherever the word Shi'ah is used generally, they are meant by it

b) Since this thesis deals with controversial subjects and terminology, it was very difficult to rely

only on one of the approved translations of the Qur'an; consequently I have made .use of all the standard translations

c) Some of the terms which occur in the text or the commentary were too long to be explained in footnotes; I have separated them in Appendices which appear at the end .of the work

I take this opportunity to express my high esteem and deep gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. A. J. Arberry, whose encouragement and instruction was the source from which I drew my inspiration. My sincere thanks are also due to my friend, Miss. J. Thompson, of the Oriental Department, University Library, for her generous and unstinted assistance throughout the work in correcting my English. My gratitude is also due to Mrs. Virginia Barnes who bore the difficulty of typing the thesis. Lastly, I would like to express my thanks to the Iraqi Government for the scholarship which .paved the way for my higher education

,April ۱۹۶۵

Irfan ‘Abdu 'l-Hamid‘

.Cambridge University

The Author and His Works

point

Abu‘Abdillah Muhammad ibn Muhammad ibn an-Nu‘man al-Harithi al-‘Ukbari al-Baghdadi(۱). He was one of the most famous divines of the Ithna-‘Ashariyyah School of the Shi‘ah and was unanimously regarded as one of their foremost scholars, while his works were considered to be among those which established the nascent theology of the Shi‘ah on a sound and clear cut basis. Abu ‘Abdillah traced his descent back to .Qahtan, so was proud of his purely Arab ancestry

He is well-known to us under two different laqabs, al-Mufid and Ibnu 'l-Mu‘allim. The former laqab

---

Ukbari, ‘Ukbarawi: his nisbah (relationship) is derived from a small town, ‘Ukbar, - ۱
near ad-Dujayl, about ten farsakhs distance from Baghdad. The name seems not to
.be Arabic. See Yaqut, Mu‘jamu 'l-buldan, vo۱.۵, p.۲۰۳

was bestowed on him, according to some authorities, by his master ‘Ali ibn ‘Isa ar-Rummani(١) with whom al-Mufid "discussed the Imamate and displayed a powerful intelligence; therefore he called him by this laqab"(٢). Others mentioned the assertion that the Twelfth Imam (Sahibu 'z- Zaman), 'The Master of the Time’, “appointed him as his deputy and bestowed upon him this honorific title(٣). His second title, Ibnu 'l-Mu‘allim, seems to have been derived from his "father's occupation as a teacher in .(the city of Wasit"(۴

Al-Mufid was born in a small village in the district of ‘Ukbara, known as Suwayqat ibn al-Basri, in ١١th Dhi 'l-Qi‘dah,٣٣۶/٩۴٧ – according to an-Najashi(۵) and al-Khwansari(۶) or in ٣٨٨, according to at-Tusi (٧) and Ibn Shahrashub(٨) , and died on the third (or second) of Ramadan ۴١٣ AH/December ١٠٢٢ AD,at al-Karkh and was buried first in his house-yard in the suburb of al-Ushnan(٩) . Afterwards his body was transferred to the .cemetery of Quraysh

Historians described the day of his death as a day of universal lamentation; "both his friends and enemies were full of mourning"(١٠). He was so highly esteemed that "eighty thousand people are said to have gathered in the public square in Baghdad at the time of his funeral"(١١). Among those who wrote elegies on him was his pupil, ash-.Sharif ar-Radi

Historians, whether from the Sunnite ranks or from those of the Shi‘ah are unanimously of the opinion that al-Mufid was one of the most brilliant scholars of his day and destined to play a constructive and

---

Abu '١-Hasan, ‘Ali ibn ‘Isa ar-Rummani al-Ikhshidi al-Warraq, one of the most - ١ illustrious doctors of the Mu‘tazilah of the tenth class, well known as an exegetist, philologist and theologian. He was called ‘Ali al-Jami‘ because of his profound and comprehensive knowledge of Fiqh, Qur’an, Nahw and Kalam. as-Sahib ibn ‘Abbad, on being questioned if he, too, had written a commentary on the Qur’an, replied ‘Ali ibn ‘Isa had left nothing for him to do. He has also been accused of Shi‘ite tendencies. See

Ibnu 'l-Murtada,al-Munyah wa 'l-amal, p.٦٥. Yaqut, Mu‘jamu 'l-udaba’, vo١.١٤, p.٧٣; as-
.Suyuṭi, Tabaqatu 'l-mufassirin, p.٢٤

al-Majlisi, Biharu 'l-anwar, the introduction to the new edition by ash-Shirazi, vo١.١ , -٢
p.٧١

.Ibn Shahrashub, Ma‘alimu 'l-‘ulama’, p.١٠١ -٣

.al-Khaṭib al-Baghdadi, Tarikh Baghdad, vo١.٣, p.٢٣١ -٤

.an-Najashi, ar-Rijal, p.٢٨٦ -٥

.al-Khwansari, Rawdatu 'l-jannat, p.٥٦٣ -٦

.at-Tusi, Rijalu 'sh-Shi‘ah, p.١٨٦ -٧

Ibn Shahrashub, op. cit., p.١٠١. Cf., Borckelmann, C., GAL, Supp.١, p.٣٢٢. Also, E.I., the -٨
.article,"al-Mufid", vo١.٣, ii, p.٦٢٥

.al-Ushnan, an old suburb of Baghdad, see Mu‘jamu 'l-buldan, vol.I, p.٢٦٢ -٩

.at-Tusi, ar-Rijal, p.١٨٧ -١٠

.Donaldson, D.M., The Shi‘ite Religion, p.٢٨٧ -١١

decisive role in the intellectual and political affairs of the Buwayhid regime. Both his friends and opponents recognized his outstanding ability and contribution to .knowledge

Al-Mufid was famous for his learning and integrity, as well as his powers of memory and reasoning. Ibnu 'n-Nadim says, "in our time Abu ‘Abdillah was the head of the Shi‘ah theologians, outstanding in the art of dialectics in the school he followed, of a penetrating wit and retentive memory. I met him and found him excelled"(۱).As-Safadi characterized him as "the unrivalled master of the.known sciences of that time"(۲). Ibn Hajar described him as, "an author of many outstanding works numbering about two hundred"(۳). Ibn Kathir described him as "the head of the Rawafid and the man who wrote many works which defended and consolidated their .(doctrines"(۴

The Shi‘ah biographers also esteemed him highly and recognized the great influence he had on later theologians and traditionists. al-Khwansari observed that "he was the most honored teacher and the spiritual head of all the Shi‘ahs, and he who followed him benefited by his knowledge; his profound comprehension of jurisprudence, scholastic theology, and the science of transmission (riwayah) was famed far and (wide."(۵

He is numbered in A‘yanu 'sh-Shi‘ah among "the chief Shi‘ah theologians", and described as the "foremost faqih and doctor of his time, whom the Shi‘ahs regarded as the master of theology, principles of jurisprudence, tradition, biography and exegesis of the Qur’an"(۶). al-Mufid, in an endeavor to consolidate Shi‘ite thought and ,give it an integral shape, compiled two books

p: ۶

.Ibnu 'n-Nadim, al-Fihrist, p.۱۷۸ -۱

.as-Safadi, al-Wafi bi 'l-wafayat, vo۱.۵, p.l ۱۶ -۲

.Ibn Hajar, Lisanu 'l-mizan, vo۱.۵, p.۳۶۸ -۳

.Ibn Kathir, al-Bidayah, vo۱.۱۲, p.۱۵ ۱۶ -۴

.al-Khwansari, Rawdatu 'l-jannat, op. cit, p.۵۶۳ -۵

.Muhsin al-Amin, al-‘Amili, A‘yanu 'sh-Shi‘ah, vol.I, pt.۲, p.۱۰۶ -۶

the first concerning the principles of belief, called Awailu 'l-maqalat, and the other concerning the principles of the practical law, called al-I'lam. These became a basis .for Shi'ah learning and their effect was far-reaching

The high position of al-Mufid can be appreciated by the fact that "the Buwayhid amir, al-Mu'tadid, used to visit him at his house and attend the discussions held at his behest"(١). According to the assertion of many authorities, al-Mufid was in con- tact with the Master of the Time and he bestowed upon him his favor and addressed him as his deputy. One of his charges runs like this, "Peace be unto thee, O our sincere disciple, in whom we have complete trust . . . may God perpetuate His guidance to you in your championing of the truth and may He reward you highly for preaching the .(truth on our behalf"(٢

Al-Mufid, at an early age, acquired his knowledge from more than sixty masters – shaykhs; among them was the celebrated divine, Ibn Babawayh al-Qummi (d. ٣٨١ AH) and the illustrious traditionist, Abu 'l-Qasim Ja'far ibn Muhammad, Ibn Qulawayh al-Qummi (d. ٣۶٨ AH)(٣) , and the famous theologian, Abu 'Ali Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn al-Junayd al-Iskafi (d. ٣٨١)(۴) . Among the prominent Shi'ah scholars who received their education from al-Mufid were ash-Sharif ar-Radi (Abu 'l- Hasan Muhammad ibn al-Husayn al-Musawi, d. ۴٠۶)(۵) , ash-.Sharif al-Murtada ('Alamu 'l-Huda Abu 'l-Qasim .('Ali ibn al-Husayn, d. ۴٣۶)(۶) and at-Tusi (Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn al- Hasan, d. ۴۵٨)(٧

,Al-Mufid represents a new

١- Ibn Hajar, op. cit., vo١.۵, p.٣۶٨.

٢- al-Majlisi, Biharu 'l-anwar, the introduction to the new edition by ash- Shirazi, vol. ١, p.٧١.

٣- For his life, see: an-Najashi, op. cit., p.٨٩; Ibn Hajar, op. cit., vo١.٢, p.١٢۵; Ibn Shahrashub, op. cit., p.٢۶.

۴- For his life, see: Ibnu 'n-Nadim, op. cit., p.١٩۶.

۵- For his life, see: Ibn Khallikan, Wafayatu 'l-a'yan, vol.٢, p.٢; an-Najashi, op. cit., p.٢٨٣;

.Ibn Hajar, opcit., vo۱.۵, p.۱۴۱

For his life, see: Ibnu '۱-Murtada, op. cit., p.۱۹; an-Najashi, op. cit., p.۱۹۲; Ibn Hajar, -۶
.op. cit., vo۱.۴, p.۲۲۳

.For his life, see: Ibn Hajar, op. cit., vo۱.۵, p.۱۳۵. Also Ibn Shahrashub, op. cit., p.۱۰۲ -۷

rational trend within Shi'ah thought, the result of which was the rejection of literal acceptance of the divine law and the introduction of rational and allegorical interpretation into Imamiyyah teaching for the first time, in an attempt to eradicate the fallacies and absurdities resulting from literal acceptance. This new method, though it had supporters, was not approved by his successors without a great deal of reluctance and criticism; some, such as 'Izzu 'd- Din al-Hasan ibn Sulayman al-Hilli, writing refutation of the'innovations' he introduced (١).

With regard to the works of al-Mufid, our sources ascribe to him two hundred books. This large number may be due to the fact that some of the titles mentioned, in a large number of cases, could be chapters, abstracts, response, or even summaries of a book, rather than complete works. It is also possible that in some instances the same book may have been known under two or more different titles.(٢)

A Historical Sketch of his Times

The period in which al-Mufid lived has a special import- ance not only from the point of view of Shi'ite theology, but also in the history of scholastic theology in general. It was a period of dogmatic controversies and sectarian disputes, each school trying to reshuffle and re-examine its teachings. It was a period when the most eminent theologians of Islam lived and exercised their influence, such as al-Baqillani (an Ash'arite), al-Qadi 'Abdu '١-Jabbar (a Mu'tazilite) and al-Mufid, the Shi'ite. Thus it is necessary to give a brief sketch of the Buwayhid regime (٣٣۴-۴۴٧

---

١ - The refutation is called al-Muhtadir, published in an-Najaf al-Ashraf (Iraq) in ١٣٧٠/١٩۵١. See: ash-Shaykh 'Abdullah, Falasifatu 'sh-Shi'ah, pp.۴۵۴-۶۶.

٢ - A full list of his works will be given later.

AH) in which al-Mufid played a remarkable role, and which was roughly coterminous with his lifetime.

The Buwayhids entered Baghdad on Jumadu 'l-Awwal, ۳۴۴/ ۱۷th January, ۹۴۶, with an army mainly composed of foreign elements under the leadership of Ahmad ibn Buwayh. The suc- cess of this entry was due partly to a secret correspondence with the Caliph al-Mustakfi (d. ۳۳۸/۹۴۹), "who received the victorious leader and bestowed upon him the honorific title of Mu'izzu 'd-Dawlah and installed him as Amiru '۱-Umara'. At the same time, his brothers 'Ali and al-Hasan received the titles of 'Imadu '۱-Dawlah and Ruknu 'd-Dawlah, respectively. Moreover, he ordered their names and titles to be struck on the coinage"(۱).

The advent of the Buwayhids to Baghdad brought about an essential and profound change in the Caliphate. It is true that the seizure of power by the Buwayhids did little more than set the seal on the development which had, in effect, placed the caliphate under the domination of army chiefs, promoted Amiru '۱-Umara'. "But this time there was the added fact that the Buwayhids were professing Shi'ahs, so much so that it might have been asked whether they were not about to sup- press a caliphate whose legitimacy had no special meaning for them"(۲).

No sooner had they entered Baghdad than they displayed their disrespect toward the Caliphate, so twelve days after, Mu'izzu 'd-Dawlah dismissed the Caliph on "the ground that he was plotting with his officers against him, and seeking help from the Hamdanids of al-Mawsil; moreover,

---

۱- Ibnu 'l-Athir, al-Kamil, vo۱.۸, p.۳۳۷, Hasan Ibrahim Hasan, Tarikhu 'l-Islami 's-siyasi, vo۱.۳, p.۴۳.

۲- E.I., the article, "Buwayhids", by Cl. Cahen, vol.۱, ii, p.۱۳۵۰.

he was annoyed by the Caliph who put the head of the Shi‘ah into prison"(۱). The dismissal of the Caliph "took place in an unceremonious manner"(۲).

From the dogmatic point of view, the Buwayhids "were imbued with Shi‘ism; they preached it energetically; and Shi‘ism was substantially strengthened by their effort"(۳). Being the adherents of a political system based on and derived from a divinely appointed Imamate "they did not recognize the claim of the Sunni caliph to supreme headship of the Islamic world"(۴), and consequently they "rejected altogether the ‘Abbasid's right to caliphate, because they were convinced that they had usurped the office from its true holders, and so the religious impulse which might have incited them to obey the ‘Abbasid Caliphate was absent"(۵).

It was essential doctrine which obliged them to accept the divinely appointed Imam as the only justified temporal and spiritual leader of Islam. As a matter of fact, they maintained the ‘Abbasid Caliphate for purely political reasons, since the abolition of it might have resulted in a colossal revolt against Buwayhid authority, which they were anxious to avoid(۶).

Yet this doctrinal divergence in the conception of political authority was responsible for a series of humiliations to the Sunni caliph. Thus the Buwayhid amirs were "the first princes who insisted on having their names mentioned in the khutbah along with that of the Caliph"(۷). This was followed by a series of further encroachments on the prerogatives of the Caliph.

They began to impose restrictions on the political

۱- ad-Duri, ‘Abdu '۱-‘Aziz, Dirasat fi 'l-‘usuri 'l-‘Abbasiyyah al-muta'akhkhirah, p.۲۴۹.

۲- Ibid., p.۲۴۹. See also: Arnold, T., The Caliphate, p.۶۱; al-Khudari,Muhadarat fi tarikhi 'l-umami 'l-Islamiyyah, vo۱.۲, p.۳۸۰.

۳- al-Maqrizi, al-Khitat, vo۱.۲, p.۳۰۸.

۴- Arnold, T., op. cit., p.۶۱.

۵- Ibnu '۱-Athir, op. cit., vo۱.۸, p.۳۳۹.

۶- ad-Duri, op. cit., p.۲۴۸. See p.II.

۷- Arnold, T., op. cit., p.۶۱.

power of the caliphs; the confiscation of their lands and properties, and the dismissal of whomsoever they desired by cauterizing their eyes with hot iron, and thereby disqualifying them from ruling. It is curious to mention that on one occasion "‘Adudu 'd-Dawlah commanded that the Caliph's name should be abolished from the Friday khutbah so that no prayer was said for the Caliph for two months, because of a slight dispute which took place between ‘Adudu 'd-Dawlah and the Caliph"(١).

It is a historical fact that with the beginning of the Buwayhid regime, the caliphate as a body-politic began to lose its importance, and the caliphs gradually, but constantly, lost all their political powers. What remained to them was, as al-Biruni observed, "Only a religious, doctrinal authority and not a secular power, exactly like that of the head of the Jalut (Diaspora) among the Jews, who have only the religious leadership with- out any temporal powers"(٢).

Beside what has been mentioned, the most important feature of this period, which has its relative importance in our present study, was that it witnessed a severe struggle between the two dominant doctrines, the Sunnite and the Shi‘ite, each trying to impose its religious sovereignty all over the Muslim world. The ‘Abbasid Caliph, after being deprived of all his effective political powers, was anxious to restore his religious supremacy among the people.

The result of this trend was the emergence of a semi-religious party, mainly composed of the ‘ulama’, fuqaha’,and the khutaba’. This semi-religious party

---

١- Ibnu '١-Jawzi, al-Muntazim, vo١.٧. p.٧٥.

٢- Quoted from ad-Duri, op. cit., p.٢٥٥.

proved to be of a special importance to the ever-weakened caliph. Thus, although the Buwayhid amirs were the real independent governors of the empire, yet it was very .dangerous for them to display openly their enmity towards the caliphs

As Prof. Arnold observed, "the inflictions of such humiliation on the caliph is in striking contrast with the honour and reverence paid to him, whenever it was politic to bring . (him forward, as the supreme head of the faith"(۱

This religious party was to play a decisive role especially during the period of Buwayhid decline and was used as a weapon by which the Caliph began to impose his will on the Buwayhid amirs. For example, when the Caliph al-Qaim (۴۲۲-۴۶۷/۱۰۳۱-۱۰۷۵) rebuked Jalalu 'd- Dawlah (۴۱۶-۴۳۵) for not punishing his slave for entering an orchard of the Caliph, "he asked the judges not to deliver judgement, the jurists to refrain from delivering response and the preachers to refrain from their duties, which forced . (the Buwayhid amir to petition the Caliph"(۲

Meanwhile, the Caliph laid emphasis on his religious duties, as a means of fortifying his prerogative against the unscrupulous behavior of the Buwayhids, which was constantly increasing. We may note in particular, as an event without previous parallel, that the Caliph, al-Qaim, wrote a theological work in the orthodox Sunni strain which was read out every Friday in the circle of the traditionists in the mosque .(of al-Mahdi(۳

As a counter-balance to this Sunni party, the Buwayhids for their part

---

.Arnold, T., op. cit., p.۶۵ -۱

.Ibnu '۱-Jawzi, op. cit., vol.۸, p.۸۲ -۲

Ibid., vo۱.۸, p.۱۰۹. Also, Mez, Adam, The Renaissance of Islam, Eng. transl. by Khuda -۳ .Bukhsh and Margoliouth, p.۶۱

began to depend largely on the Shi'ah. It is said that Mu'izzu'd-Dawlah intended from the very beginning to abolish the 'Abbasid Caliphate and to transfer it to Abu 'l- Hasan .(Muhammad ibn Yahya az-Zaydi(١

He was deterred from carrying out this scheme by his wazir (vizier), who told him, "today you are faced with a caliph whom you and your followers believe has no right to the caliphate; thus if you command them they will kill him and consider themselves innocent of his blood, whereas if you replace him by an 'Alid Caliph, whom you and your followers believe to be the rightful caliph, then if he commands them to kill you, . (they will perform his command"(٢

From this, it would appear that the Buwayhids maintained the caliphate "purely for political reasons" because they were aware that "had they destroyed the caliphate in Baghdad, the institution would have reappeared elsewhere"(٣). The caliphate for them, then, was a means to legalize their authority over the Sunnites in their state, and to strengthen their diplomatic relations with the world outside by the weight of .the moral authority and respect which the Sunnite caliph still enjoyed

Thus it is obvious that the Buwayhid period was the scene of a severe struggle between two divergent political powers, and echoing this, of two doctrinal schools within the Muslim community. As for the importance of this period in the founding and :developing of Shi'ite theology, it can be demonstrated in two points

First: With the beginning of the

١- ad-Duri, op. cit., p.٢۴٨.

٢- Ibnu 'ل-Athir, op. cit., vol.٨, p.٣٣٩; Cf., ad-Duri, op. cit., p.٢۴٨.

٣- Ibid.; al-Khudari, op. cit., vol.٢., p.٣٧٨.

Buwayhid regime, a severe dogmatic struggle arose between the two dominant doctrines, the Shi‘ites and the Sunnites. "It is certain that the Buwayhids welcomed somewhat indiscriminately the Shi‘is or Mu‘tazilis of different shades of opinion, but politically they were Twelvers"(1).

This sectarian struggle culminated in ٣٥١ AH, when Mu‘izzu 'd-Dawlah caused Shi‘ite curses to be inscribed on the walls of the mosques which run thus; "May God curse Mu‘awiyah ibn Abi Sufyan, and him who prevented al-Hasan's body from being buried behind the grave of his grandfather, and him who exiled Abu Dharr, and him who expelled al-‘Abbas from the shura (electoral council)"(2).

These curses were publicly displayed while the Caliph was unable to forbid them. This dogmatic rift deepened still further when Mu‘izzu 'd-Dawlah introduced, "influenced perhaps by Daylamite practices"(3), the commemorating of the martyrdom of al-Husayn. On the ١٠th of Muharram, ‘Ashura day, the chief festival of the Shi‘ah, the bazaars were closed, the butchers suspended business, the cooks ceased cooking, the cisterns were emptied of their contents, pitchers were placed with felt covering the streets, women walked about with fallen tresses, blackened faces, torn dresses, striking their faces and wailing for al-Husayn.

In the same year, on the ١٨th Dhu 'l-Hijjah, the celebration of the day of the "pond of Khumm", the day on which the Prophet is said to have nominated ‘Ali as his successor, was officially inaugurated at Baghdad, fires were lit, drums were beaten, horns blown, and people hastened from the early morning

---

١- E.I, the article, "Buwayhids", by Cl. Cahen, vol.I, ii, p.١٣٥٢.

٢- as-Suyuti, Tarikhu 'l-khulafa’, p.٢۶۶; Ibn Khaldun, at-Tarikh, vol.۴, p.٨٨۶; Cf., Mez, Adam, op. cit., p.۶٨.

٣- E.I, the article, "Buwayhids", vol.I, ii, p.١٣٥٢.

.(to the cemetery of Quraysh"(١)

These foreign and newly imported practices gave rise to bitter sectarian hatreds, and were responsible for sporadic civil wars. "In ٣٨٨, a destructive conflict broke out .(between the two sects and consequently al-Karkh district was plundered(٢)

In ٣۴۶ AH a similar civil disturbance occurred between "the Shi'ite section of al-Karkh and the Sunnites because of as-sabb,(٣) which resulted in a heavy massacre"(۴). .These civil conflicts took place continually in the year ٣۴٨-٣۵١,٣۵٣, ٣٩٣-٣٩٨ and ۴٠٩

This was the characteristic feature of the period; what, then, was the attitude of al-Mufid towards current events? al-Mufid as the "head of the Shi'ah and the teacher of the Rawafid"(۵) was destined to play an active role in defending the dogma of the Ithna-'Ashariyyah school of the Shi'ah. Due to "his high ranking position at the courts of the Buwayhids and the princes of dynasties"(۶), he enjoyed spiritual supremacy .and considerable influence over the affairs of that time

Thus, it was during the Buwayhid period and because of their energetic support, says al-Maqrizi, "that the teachings of the Rawafid spread widely in North Africa, Syria, Diyar Bakr, Kufah, Basrah, Baghdad, all 'Iraq, Khurasan, Transoxiana, Hijaz, Yaman and Bahrayn"(٧). As a result of this tremendous expansion of Shi'ism, there were .ceaseless disturbances and dissensions between the Shi'ites and the Sunnites

In ٣٩٣ AH, widespread disturbances occurred and the trouble-makers spread all over the country, a thing which caused Bahau 'd-Dawlah (٩٨٩-١٠١٢ AD) to send the leader of the army to deal

---

١ - Ibnu 'l-Jawzi, op. cit., vol.٧, p.١٠; Ibn Kathir, al-Bidayah, vol.١١, p.٢۴٣. Also, Mez, Adam, op. cit., p.۶٩.

٢ - Ibn Kathir, op. cit., vol.ll, p.٢٢١.

٣ - Denouncing certain companions of the Holy Prophet (of Islam).

۴ - Ibid., p.٢٣٢.

۵- Ibn Taghri Birdi, an-Nujumu 'z-zahirah, vol.۴, p.۲۵۸; as-Safadi, op. cit., vol.۵, p.۱۱۶.

۶- Ibn Taghri Birdi, op. cit., vol.۴, p.۲۵۸.

۷- al-Maqrizi, al-Khitat, vol.۲, p.۳۰۸.

with the situation. He reached Baghdad, suppressed by force the agitators and prevented both The Sunnites and the Shi'ites from demonstrating their doctrines and expelled Ibnu 'l-Mu'allim, the Shaykh of the Imamiyyah. Thus the city regained its .(tranquillity(١

Second: The second reason for the importance of the Buway- hids in the development of Shi'ah theology, is that they pro- vided a meeting point where Shi'ah theology was influenced by the rational methods of the Mu'tazilah. This dogmatic and intellectual relationship which, in the words of Prof.Macdonald, is "the great mystery of Muslim History"(٢) , has still not received full attention, and can only be made clear by comparative research based on a profound historical study of the Buwayhid period .from the dogmatic point of view

At the end of the third century of the Hijrah, Mu'tazilism was suffering a severe decline in political influence, which began early with the accession of al-Mutawakkil to the caliph- ate (٢٣٢/٨۴٧). This political decline was coupled at the beginning of the fourth century with a decisive triumph of Ash'ar-ism which "evolved a new orthodox .(scholasticism and defeated the Mu'tazilites on their own ground(٣

In this perilous situation, the Mu'tazilah might have been induced by the instinct of self preservation to conclude a political alliance with Shi'ism, then the official and politically influential doctrine of the state. One of the reasons which facilitated this compromise was that "the vagueness of Rafidites had been replaced by the much more definite .(Imamite form of Shi'ism(۴

It is curious that

.Ibnu '١-Athir, op. cit., vol.٩, p.١٢۶ -١

.Quoted from Holister, J.N., The Shi'a of India, p.٢۶ -٢

.Gibb, H.A.R., Mohammadanism, p.١١۶ -٣

.Watt, W.M., Islamic Philosophy and Theology, p.٨٣ -۴

the very Mu‘tazilism of which "the refutation and rejection of the extremely heterogenous elements of Rafidites was the centre of its invaluable service to the cause of Islam" (۱) was now trying to come to some sort of agreement with it. Here we have also to bear in mind that the "suggestion has been made that Mu‘tazilism was essentially an attempt to work out a com- promise that would in part overcome the cleavage between Sunnites and Shi‘ites" (۲).

At any rate, Shi‘ism and Mu‘tazilism, as adh-Dhahabi says, "established from about ۳۷۰ AH a friendly and brotherly rela- tionship with each other" (۳). al-Maqdisi was fully aware of this interrelation; he states that "the majority of the Shi‘ah in Persia were Mu‘tazilite, and that the Buwayhid, ‘Adudu 'd-Dawlah adopted it" (۴).

This dogmatic interrelation is affirmed by both Adam Mez and Goldziher, who say that "theologically the Shi‘ahs are the heirs of the Mu‘tazilah", and that "in the fourth century there was actually no real system of Shi‘ite theology; henceforth the Shi‘ite amir, ‘Adudu 'd-Dawlah, merely adapted himself to the view of the Mu‘tazilite" (۵).

This attachment of Mu‘tazilism to the ruling power was of special importance, which is confirmed by al-Maqrizi, who says that "Mu‘tazilism spread considerably under the Buwayhids regime in Iraq, Khurasan and Transoxiana" (۶).

I am inclined to suggest that the period in which as-Sahib ibn ‘Abbad (۳۲۶-۳۸۵/۹۳۹-۹۹۵) governed the empire inde- pendently during the emirate of Fakhru 'd-Dawlah al-Buwayhi and which lasted eighteen years (۳۶۷-۳۸۵/۹۷۷-۹۹۵) is the period within which

---

۱- Zuhdi Hasan Jarullah. Nyberg, H.S., his intro. to his ed. of Kitabu 'l-Intisar, p.۲۴.

۲- Watt, W.M., op. cit., p.۸۳.

۳- Quoted from, al-Mu‘tazilah, p.۲۰۷; (adh-Dhahabi, Mizanu 'l-i‘tidal, vol.۲, p.۲۳۰).

۴- al-Maqdisi, Ahsanu 't-taqasim, p.۴۳۹.

۵- Mez, Adam, op. cit., p.۶۲; Cf. Goldziher, L, Vorlesungen über den Islam, the Arabic translation, p.۲۲۴.

۶- al-Maqrizi, op. cit., vo۱.۲, p.۳۵۸.

.Shi‘ism adopted the rational system of Mu‘tazilism

Abu 'l-Qasim Isma‘il ibn ‘Abbad as-Sahib is known as an "illustrious Mu‘tazilite who inherited his ideas from his father who wrote a book on the ordinances of the Qur’an, Ahkamu 'l- Qur’an, in which he supported Mu‘tazilism"(۱). In his formative years, as-Sahib was greatly influenced by and imbued with their dogmas till he came to be .(known "as one of their fore- most masters"(۲

When he was wazir, he used his office as a means to support whole-heartedly the Mu‘tazilite teachings so "people began to follow the doctrine he professed, and copy his words, desiring reward from him"(۳). as-Sahib has also been mentioned among the Shi‘ah divines and .was accused of Shi‘ite tendencies. Ibn Hajar says "that he .(added to the innovation of the Mu‘tazilah the heterodoxy of the Shi‘ah"(۴

This intellectual influence of Mu‘tazilism on Shi‘ism which is confirmed by ash-Shahrastani(۵) , Ibn Taymiyyah(۶) and ad- Dawani(۷) was emphatically rejected by the Shi‘ah. They were, and still are, anxious to deny this impact on their dogmas, which are supposed to be the fruits of the direct teachings of the divinely-inspired Imams. al-Mufid himself rejected this charge, which seems to be very old, and denied that the . (Shi‘ah were influenced by and borrowed from the Mu‘tazilah(۸

But a critical and comparative study of his book, Tashih I‘tiqadati 'l- Imamiyyah with that of his master, Ibn Babawayh al-Qummi, which is the purpose of this thesis, establishes the fact that the shifting of Shi‘ah theology from an authoritarian

---

۱- Yaqut, Mu'jamu 'l-udaba’, vol.۶, p.۱۲۷.

۲- Ibn Hajar, Lisanu 'l-mizan, vol.۱, p.۴۱۳.

۳- Yaqut, op. cit., vol.۶, p.۲۲۵.

۴- Ibn Hajar, op. cit., p.۴۱۳.

۵- ash-Shahristani, al-Milal, vol.۱, p.۲۰۹. Also, p.۲۲۴.

۶- Ibn Taymiyyah, ar-Rasail, vol.۳, p.۱۱۵.

۷- ad-Dawani, Jalalu 'd-Din, Sharhu 'l-‘aqaidi 'l-‘Adudiyyah, (quoted from Muhammad

.('Abduh bayna 'l- falasifah wa 'l-mutakallimin, edited by Sulayman Dunya, p.۲۶

al-Mufid, Ajwibatu 'l-masaili 's-saghaniyyah, MS. No.۴۴۲, an-Najaf al- Ashraf, (Iraq), -۸
.Maktabat Muhsin al-Hakim, fol. ۱۴

stand, repre- sented by Ibn Babawayh, to a rational interpretation cultivated first by al-Mufid, was a direct result of this Mu'tazilite impact which is specifically denied by him. It is worth observing that the "Mu'tazilite influence has maintained its hold on the Shi'itic literature up to the present time. It is a serious error to assert that after the decisive victory of the Ash'arite theology, the Mu'tazilite teachings ceased to play any active part in religion or literature. The rich dogmatic literature of the Shi'ah extending into our own days refutes such an assertion"(١)

١. The Metaphorical Interpretation of the Baring of the Shank (Kashfu 'S-Saq)

In the Name of Allah, the Merciful, the Compassionate

Praise be to Allah for His bounties, and peace be upon Muhammad and his family. This is the emendation of A Shi'ite Creed of Abu Ja'far Ibn Babawayh, may Allah have mercy upon him, compiled by ash-Shaykh al-Mufid Abu 'Abdillah Muhammad ibn an-Nu'man*, may Allah have mercy upon him.

The learned divine, Abu Ja'far (٢)Muhammad ibn 'Ali ibn al- Husayn Ibn Babawayh al-Qummi, died in ٣٨١ AH(٣), says, in the treaties of his (Shi'ite) creed, on the meaning of His, the Exalted's Speech:

On a day when a shank (saq) shall be bared, and they shall be summoned to prostrate themselves, but they cannot [٦٨:٤٢].

as-Saq (shank) here means the result, or consummation of the affair and its intensity.

Ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: The meaning of the verse quoted above is intended for the Day of Resurrection on which an important, hard and intense matter will be disclosed, and that

---

١- Goldziher, I., op. cit., p.٢٢٢.

٢- N reads Muhammad ibn Muhammad, which is correct.

٣- Not found in N.

will be the reckoning and scrutinizing of (man's) actions; the recompensing for (good or bad) deeds, and the divulging of the heart secrets; the revealing of mysteries, and the appraisal of good and bad acts. Hence, He (Allah) designates by as saq the gravity of the matter; and by the same reasoning, the Arabs used to symbolize the violence and severity of war with their peculiar expression, "The war broke out [amongst us] (qamati 'l-harbu [bina] 'ala saq)"(١).

And their poet, Sa'd ibn Khalid, says:

The war disclosed all its severety, and revealed its full calamity.

The eagle of death appeared,

Bearing in its train the decreed fate.

Also, like this is their expression, "The fair is set up", (qad qamati 's-suq), denoting when the people crowd together, and buying and selling goes briskly with much effort and exertion.

٢. The Metaphorical Interpretation of "The Hand (Al-Yad)"

Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, similarly explains "hand" in the sense of strength, and adduces, to support his view, the verse:

And remember Our servant David, possessed of strength (ayd) [٣٨:١٧].

And he says: dha'l-ayd, means possessed of strength (quwwah).

ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: The word yad has another interpretation which denotes grace. The poet says:

He has bestowed favours on me which I do not deny;

For indeed denial of favours is but ingratitude.

So, it is possible that the saying of Allah, the Exalted, Dawuda dha 'l-ayd, means Dawud (David), a bountiful man. Similar, also, is the saying of Allah:

[۵:۶۴] Nay, but both His hands are outspread.

Here, by "The two hands", are meant

p: ۲۰

۱- See al-Maydani, Majmaʿu 'l-amthal, vol.۲, p.۴۷; cf., az-Zamakhshari, al- Kashshaf, vol.۳, p.۲۱۰; ar-Razi, Tafsir, vol.۸, p.۲۰۳.

.the two favours of this life and the life hereafter

(The Breathing of the Spirit (into man) (Nafkhu 'l-Arwah .۳

:Abu Ja‘far says, concerning the Spirit in the Speech of Allah, the Exalted

,[And I breathed into it of My Spirit [۱۵:۲۹

that it is, in this context, a created Spirit (ruh). He attributes it to Himself in the same way as He attributes the House (Ka‘bah) to Himself, although it is created by Him. Ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: The reason for attributing the Spirit or the House to Himself is not merely that they were created by Him; but, also, that they have been .distinguished by His greatness and glory, and endued with His awfulness

This indicates that this Spirit and this House are favored with His sublimity and glory, which have not been granted to any other spirit or house save them, thus to draw the .attention of creation by this means – to believe in and exalt them

(Metonym and Metaphor (in the Qur’an .۴

Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, has said, concerning the interpretation of :the Speech of Allah, the Exalted

O Iblis!) What prevented thee from prostrating thyself before that I created with My) .[two hands (yadayy)? [۳۸:۷۵

'.(By 'two hands'), He means 'My strength and My power (qudrati wa quwwati)

Abu ‘Abdillah (al-Mufid) says: This is not correct(۱), since it involves repetition in meaning and implies that Allah says: 'By My strength, by My strength', or 'By My power, by My power', because literally 'strength' is equivalent to 'power', and vice versa, and there is no meaning in such

---

.T, laysa hadha huwa 'l-wajh fi 't-tafsir: N, laysa huwa 'l-wajh -۱

.a statement

The correct explanation is that advanced above concerning grace (lutf); consequently, the verse signifies, 'Allah's double grace in this world and the world hereafter'. In the same way, the ba in Allah's saying (bi yadayya), 'with My two hands', stands for (lam), as if Allah has said: "(Khalaqtu liyadayya), I have created for My :hands", meaning by this, 'for My double grace', as He has said

,[And I have not created jinn and mankind except to worship Me [۵۱:۵۶

since worship is a gift from Allah, and His grace upon them, for it leads them to His perpetual grace. A probable meaning of 'both My hands', is the double meaning of power and grace as though the Almighty said, "created with My own power and grace". Another explanation is that the attribution of the 'hands' to Allah was intended to stress the overwhelming power of Allah, and the act was accomplished by His sole .will, irrespective of His strength or grace or anything else

:This interpretation is supported by the verse

,[That is for what thy hands have forwarded [۲۲:۱۰

:and it means 'what you have forwarded of your deeds'; and also by Allah's saying

,[Whatever misfortune may visit you is for what your own hands have earned [۴۲:۳۰

which signifies 'what you have acquired'. The Arabs often used the proverb: "Thy hand hath tied, and thy mouth hath blown into it" (yadaka awkata wa fuka nafakh)(۱), in the sense that it was your doing and you carried

---

.See al-Maydani, op. cit., vol.۲, p.۲۴۸ -۱

.it out and performed it though you did not use your actual hands (limbs) in it

The Attribution of Scheming: beguiling and Mockery to Allah .۵

Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, maintained that the meaning of Allah's :saying

,[The hypocrites) seek to beguile Allah, but it is He Who beguileth them [۴:۱۴۲)

,[and: They have forgotten Allah, so He hath forgotten them [۹:۶۷

,[and: And they devised, and Allah devised, and Allah is the best of devisers [۳:۵۴

,[and: Allah shall mock them [۲:۱۵

. (is that Allah will requite them for their base acts(۱

Abu 'Abdillah concurs, and adds that the interpretation advanced by Abu Ja'far is sound, but he has not supplied the reason; for the reason for the interpretation given above is that the Arabs often called a thing by the name of the recompense it brought, because of the relation which exists, and the comparison which can be made between the name and the recompense, since acts which bring a certain requital can fittingly .(be called by its name(۲

Allah says: Those who consume the property of orphans unjustly, they only consume .[fire in their belies [۴:۱۰

Thus, He called the consumed property, though in itself good; fire, because the .punishment for it is fire

The Attribution of Forgetfulness to Allah .۶

Abu Ja'far cites: "Forgetfulness, like beguiling, can only be applied to Allah in the sense ".that with this He will requite the evil-doers

Abu 'Abdillah adds that the true interpretation is not what has been advanced, because forgetfulness literaly signifies both abandonment and postponement. Allah,

:the Exalted, says

p: ۲۳

.T, ‘an jazai 'l-af‘al: N, al-jaza’ ‘ala 'l-af‘al, which is correct -۱

.T, falamma kanati 'l-mujaza: N, falamma kanati 'l-af‘ali 'l-mujaza, which is correct -۲

Whatever verse We abrogate or cause to be forgotten, We bring one better than it or .[the like of it [۲:۱۰۶

Now, here,'what We abrogate' means, 'We leave it in place or suspend it'. Hence, the Exalted, means by 'They forget Allah', that 'they departed from their obedience to Allah', and He meant by 'so He forgot them', that, 'He withdraws His mercy from :them'. And He means by

[So He makes them forget their own souls [۵۹:۱۹

that 'He made them uneasy through His withdrawal, and that He obliged them to disregard their own good and not to care for their own interest'. This is a tenable interpretation of the verse, though the other one, advanced by Abu Ja'far, is not .refuted, and Allah, the Exalted, is the granter of success

(The Attributes of Allah (Sifat Allah .۷

Abu Ja'far says: "Whenever we describe Allah, the Blessed, the Sublime, by the attributes of His essence,(۱) .....Abu 'Abdillah, may Allah have mercy upon him, adds that the attributes of Allah are of two categories: the first are those relating to His essence and called, for this reason, the Attributes of Essence (sifatu 'dh-dhat); the second category are those relating to His acts and called the Attributes of Action .((sifatu 'l- fi'l

The Attributes of Essence are those inherent in it, those of which the essence must necessarily be possessed, and hence cannot be separated from His essence. As for the Attributes of Action, they apply to Allah only at the time of the action and not before

---

.N reads only: Faslun fi sifati 'dh-dhat wa sifati 'l-af'al -۱

it. Moreover, the Attributes of Essence involve the description of Allah by epithets such as the Ever living (hayy), the Powerful (qadir), the Omniscient (‘alim), which Allah possesses eternally and forever, while the Attributes of Action, such as the Creator (khaliq), the Sustainer (raziq), the Giver of new life (muhyi, Revivifier), the Annihilator (mumit), the Originator (mubdi), the resurrector (mu‘id), are applicable only after the .action and not before it

The (second) distinction between the Attributes of Essence and those of Action is that, in the case of the Attributes of Essence, the opposite cannot be predicted of the One Who is in possession of them, and cannot be separated from them (i.e., these attributes), whilst in the case of the Attributes of Action, their opposites can be predicted to the Possessor, and He can be separated from them. You cannot say, for example, that He dies or is weak, or is ignorant, and you cannot describe Him as being anything other than Living, Knowing and Powerful, whilst you can say that Allah is not a Creator today, He is not the Giver of sustenance to Zayd, or that He is not the Giver of new life (Revivifier), or that He is not the Originator of something at this particular .time, or He is not the Restorer of it

Furthermore, Allah can be described by such antonyms as He gives and withholds, causes to live and causes to die, He originates and resurrects, He brings into existence and annihilates. This is

the salient point(۱) which should be considered concerning the Attributes of Essence .and Action; and the distinction between them

The Belief concerning the Origination of Human Actions .۸

Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja‘far(۲), may Allah have mercy upon him, says: "Human actions are created (makhluqah), in the sense that Allah possesses fore-knowledge (khalq taqdir) [of them], and not in the sense that Allah compels mankind to act in a particular manner by creating a certain disposition (khalq takwin). The meaning of all this is that ".Allah never ceases to be aware of the potentialities (maqadir) of human beings

Abu ‘Abdillah, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: The correct doctrine transmitted from the Family of the Prophet (Ahlu 'l-Bayt), may Allah bless him and his progeny, is that, "the actions of men are not created by Allah", and what is related by Abu Ja‘far is .not a genuine traditions, and the authority for it not acceptable

On the contrary, the genuine reports are diametrically opposed to it, so if this were so – as the un- scrupulous scholars maintained – then it could be said, for instance, that he who knew the Prophet 'created' him, or he who knew something about what the Almighty Allah has fashioned and proved it for himself (i.e., confirmed his belief in it) .created this particular thing

Thus the (rational) argument shows that this is a fallacy which even the rank and file of the Imams' following would not perpetrate, least of all the Imams themselves, peace be upon them. Predestination, however, linguistically implies creation, since to determine

---

۱- T, fathabatati 'l-‘ibrah: N, fathabatati 'l-ghayriyyah.

۲- (without ash-Shaykh. (N, qala Abu Ja‘far.

a thing involves action, while the knowledge, or conception, of a thing does not; yet in all circumstances Allah, the Exalted, is far removed from the creation of abominable .or base deeds

It has been related that Abu 'l-Hasan ‘Ali ibn Muhammad ibn ‘Ali ibn Musa ar-Rida, peace be upon them, was asked about human actions, whether they are created by Allah; he, peace be upon him, answered: "If He created their actions, He would not :have dissociated Himself from them. Whereas He, the Exalted, stated that

,[Allah renounces the polytheists (as does also) His Messenger [٩:٣

which signifies that He dissociates Himself from their polytheism and base actions, and not from their beings."Abu Hanifah asked Abu '١-Hasan Musa ibn Ja‘far, peace be upon them both, about human actions, and from whom they proceed; he replied that -:there were three alternatives

,i) that all actions are from Allah, the Sublime, or

.ii) that they proceed jointly from man and Allah, or iii) that they are from man alone

Now, if they were all from Allah, the Sublime, then He alone deserves to be praised for their goodness or to be blamed for their baseness, and so praise or blame for them pertain to none save Him; if they are created jointly by Allah and His servant, then the praise or the blame would pertain to them both. Since these two alternatives are absurd, it is self-evident that human actions are all from men; it rests with Him; if He pleases, He has the right

to punish them for their wickedness, or if He pleases He will pardon them, for the reward of piety and forgiveness is in His hands. And there are still further traditions .and reports which can be adduced in support of this

(Concerning Human Actions (faslun fi af'Ali 'L–khalq .٩

However, it is an established fact that the Book of Allah, the Exalted, takes precedence over the traditions and reports. Hence it should be the touchstone for determining the genuine reports and the fabrications. (If this fact is admitted), then whatever the Qur'an approves is absolutely true, and should be followed and that .alone

:Now, the Almighty says

Who has created all things well, and He originated the creation of man out of clay .[[٣٢:٧

So He declares that whatever He has created is good and far from being abominable; had He created abomin- able actions, He would never have characterized them as praise- worthy actions. Moreover, the affirmation that what Allah has created is good refutes the assumption of those who maintained that Allah is the Creator of base .actions

:The Almighty also says

,[Thou seest not in the creation of the All-merciful any imperfection [٦٧:٣

and since unbelief and falsehood are defects, so also is self-contradictory speech; how, then, can they attribute human actions to Allah, knowing that they are full of defects and contradictions, when Allah Himself denounced and rejected such attributions, and affirmed that: Thou seest not in the creation of the All-merciful any .imperfection

(Predestination and Free Will (Al–Jabr wa 't–tafwid .١٠

:Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says

There is neither (complete) compulsion (or constraint) (on human beings), nor" (complete) delegation (or freedom), but the matter is midway between the two [extremes] (amrun bayna amrayn)." Then he adduces, to support this definition, a mursal tradition. He was asked to define what was meant by 'an affair midway .'between the two

He said: "For instance, you see a man intent upon a crime and you forbid him to do it, but he does not desist, and you leave him; then he commits the crime. Now, because he did not accept (your advice) and you left him, this does not mean that you are the ".person who commanded him to commit the crime

Ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him ,comments that jabr is compulsion in respect of an act, and constraint by reason of coercion or overpowering; this involves the creation of an act in a living being without his having the power to reject or avoid it. It may convey, also, an action which, although within human capacity, a man might perform under compulsion or out of fear or constraint .by reason of coercion

Nevertheless, it originally conveys the meaning of the performance of an act without having the power to avoid it, as has been demonstrated above. Thus, if the above-mentioned definition of jabr (compulsion) is approved, then it represents precisely the .doctrine of the advocates of the belief that actions are created by Allah

This is because they hold that Allah has created the capacity in

human beings, and that it is valid for one single action, and not for both the action and its opposite. And they maintain that Allah has created evil in human beings. So, they .are, in fact Predestinarians (Mujabbirah) and uphold predestination unquestioningly

As for delegation (tafwid)(١) , this means the lifting of the restrictions religion imposes on human beings – together with absolute freedom and licence in their actions – and . (this is the doctrine of the dualists and nihilist (az-Zanadiqah wa ashabu 'l-ibahat)(٢

We believe) that the correct doctrine is a middle course between these two) extremes. Hence, although Allah has enabled man to act by virtue of the capacity with which He has endowed him, nevertheless, He has imposed with these restrictions, has delineated man's course of action, and has admonished him against abominable acts, through intimidation, and by His promises and threats; by thus enabling them, .He does not constrain them to particular actions

On the other hand, as He forbids many actions to men, and places limitations on them and commands them to do good and admonishes them against evil, (this shows that) He does not delegate the performance of their actions to them completely. This is the .distinction between Compulsion and Delegation, as we have made it clear above

(The Belief concerning Allah's Intention and Will (Al-Mashiah Wa 'l-Iradah .١١

Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: "Allah wills (sha'a) and intends (arada), and He does not like (to be disobeyed) and He does not approve (of it); it is His will that nothing

---

١- .See p.٨٩

٢- ١١ Prof. Nicholson gives the following explanation for the word zaddiq: "Zaddiq is an Aramaic word meaning 'righteous'. Its etymological equivalent in Arabic is siddiq, which has a different meaning, namely 'veracious'. Zaddiq passed into Persian in the form zandik, which was used by the Persians before Islam, and zindiq is the Arabicised form of the latter word". See A Literary History of the Arabs, p.٣٧٥. Also, cf.,

Prof. Browne's A Literary History of Persia, (vol.١, pp.١٥٩-٦٠). This interpretation, however, is not accepted by some scholars like Prof. Massignon, L., see E.I, vo١.۴, put out a new and non-orthodox explanation (zand) of the Avesta, and which p.١٢٢٨. "Under the Sasanids, originally, this name branded anyone who dared was then applied to Manicheans and Mazdakites in particular". See Brockelman, C., History of the Islamic Peoples, Eng. Transl., p.١١٣. "In Islam, it denotes", says Prof, Tritton, "a Manichee, any Dualist, a Buddist Monk and, later on, any free-thinker". See Islam, Belief and Practices, The Glossary, p.١٩٠. The movement during the second part of the second century of the hijrah represented both a religious and political danger to Islam, which compelled Islam to combatit, politically by practical measures carried out by the government itself, and theologically, in the form of an intellectual revolt against dualist ideas in religion; this was left for the Mu'tazilah who represented – as the late Michelangelo Guidi observed, "The militant wing of the orthodoxy against the dualist heresies". See Gibb, H.A.R., Studies on the Civilization of Islam, article no.۴, 'The Social Significance of the Shuubiya', p.۶٧. For a similar opinion, see al-Khayyat, Kitabu 'l-Intisar, the Introduction by the Editor, Nyberg, H.S.

should take place except that of which He has knowledge, and His intention is the ".same

Ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, comments that what has been mentioned by Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, in this respect is not clear and leads to error and confusion, because he relied on the apparent meaning of divergent traditions (ahadith mukhtalifah)(١) and following the transmitters without .critical insight

The fact of the matter is that Allah wills only good acts and intends only those that are seemly (becoming), and He does not will base actions, and does not intend sins. Allah :is exalted far above what the liars assert. Allah says

,[And Allah wishes no injustice for His servants [۴۰:۳۱

:and He, the Sublime, says

;[Allah desires ease for you and desires not hardship for you [۲:۱۸۵

:and He, the Sublime, says

Allah desires to make (things) clear to you, and to guide you in the ways of those who .[were before you [۴:۲۶

:He, the Sublime, says

And Allah desires to turn to you (mercifully), and those who follow their lusts, desire .[that you should deviate (with great deviation) [ibid.۲۷

:Also, He, the Sublime, says

.[Allah desires to make your task light for you, for man is created weak [ibid ۲۸

Thus, He, the Praised, declares that He desires not hardship for His servants, instead He desires ease for them, and He intends to guide them, and He does not intend to delude them, and wills that their burdens should

---

١- See p.٩٨.

.be light and He does not wish to overburden them

So, if He wills that they should sin, then He would never have wished that they should be shown the way and that their burden should be made light and their path easy, whereas the Book of Allah bears witness to the opposite of what those in error assert falsely, that Allah is exalted above the assertion of the evil-doers.

As for the saying of Allah: Whomsoever Allah desires to guide, He enlarges his breast ;to Islam

and whomsoever He desires to lead astray, He makes his breast narrow and“ constricted [۶:۱۲۵]” (۱)

on which the Predestinarians are dependent in this matter, then there is no support for the advocates of predestination in this; since the meaning of the verse is that if Allah intends to bestow His grace and favor on man as the reward of his obedience, then He will enlarge his breast to Islam and endow him with His favors, by which he is .enabled to continue in obedience

Thus, hidayah (guidance) signifies here ni‘mah (grace). Allah says in the Qur’an, :relating the speech of the people of Paradise

,[All praise is due to Allah, Who guided us to this [۷:۴۳

which means, 'Praise be to Allah Who favoured us with His guidance and rewarded us .'for it

:In the same manner, dalal (error) is equivalent to punishment in the saying of Allah

.[Surely the sinners are in error and insanity! [۵۴:۴۷

Thus Allah called His punishment error

۱- * * Not found in N.

and His grace guidance, and this because basically 'error' is equivalent to 'destruction' and 'guidance' to 'salvation'. Allah, the Almighty, relating the speech of the Arab :polytheists, says

What, when we have gone astray in the earth, shall we indeed be (again) in a new ,[creation? [۳۲:۱۰

.'which means, 'when we have been destroyed

Thus the meaning of the verse, 'If Allah wills to guide' and 'If Allah wills to lead him astray', is as demonstrated above; as, also, the interpretation of the saying of Allah, 'makes his breast narrow and constricted', is that He will withhold His succor from him as punishment for his rebelliousness and deprive him of the favours He bestowed .upon him in retribution for his evil doing

Hence, the enlarging of the breast is the reward for obedience shown by men which itself came only by the succour of Allah, (sharhu 's-sadr: thawabu 't- ta'ah bi 't-tawfiq), whereas the narrowing. of the breast is the punishment of rebelliousness, which in itself results from the withholding of (Divine) succour, (tadyiqu 's-sadr: 'iqabu 'l-ma'siyah biman'i 't-tawfiq). Thus, there is no support in the verse given above for the opponents (i.e., opponents of free will), who allege that Allah, Almighty, turns men away from faith, and prevents them from accepting Islam, and that it is His intention .they should not believe and His will that they should err

:As for Allah's saying

And if thy Lord had willed, whoever is in the earth would have believed, all of

,[them, all together [۱۰:۹۹

it was only to stress His Omnipotence and that He is able if He wills – to constrain them to believe by coercion and compulsion, but it is His will that they should believe .freely and by choice

The rest of the verse makes this (i.e., what we have said) plain: Will you then constrain men to become believers? [ibid]. He is able to constrain them to believe if He wills, but He does not, even though it would be an easy task for Him if He willed. All the other verses which they adduce in support of their opinion are to be interpreted in the same .way

As for the Predestinarians (Mujabbirah) they avoid asserting that Allah wills that He should be disobeyed or denied and that His saints should be killed and His friends abused, by saying that everything should be in accordance with His fore-knowledge, .and He intends that disobedience to Him should be a sin and absolutely forbidden

In fact, they commit the very error which they eschewed and implicate themselves in what they abhor, because it was in the eternal knowledge of Allah that bad is bad, and what is in the eternal, universal knowledge of Allah should be, then what is the validity of their fleeing from a thing to its double, and taking refuge from one meaning in .another that exactly reproduces it

How can they deal like this with intelligent people? Is their assumption not like the assertion of one who

says: "I do not abuse Zayd but I abuse Abu ‘Amr, and they are one and the same." And, like the self-contradictory speech of the Jews who said: "We do not deny Muhammad (peace be upon him and his progeny) but we deny Ahmad." This is but foolishness and ignorance on their part, and futile and weak effort on the part of .those who rely on it

(The belief concerning destiny and decree (Al–Qada’ wa 'L–Qadar .۱۲

ash-Shaykh Abu Ja‘far says(۱) , concerning the belief in Destiny and Decree, "Discussion of qadar is forbidden", and he narrates in support of this proposition an .unauthentic tradition

Ash-Shaykh Abu ‘Abdillah al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, comments that Abu Ja‘far relied in this on a shadhdh hadith – which can be interpreted in many reasonable ways.well-known to learned men, even if they established it as sound and .authenticated

Thus his proposition does not consti- tute a definitive description. It would have been better had he not indulged himself by discussing the matter without fully comprehending its meaning. Qada’ is a well-defined term in Arabic usage, as may be -:proved by the evidence of the Qur’an. Qada’ has four meanings

:Khalq – 'creation', as is proved by the saying of Allah, the Exalted .۱

Then He ascended Himself to heaven . . . So He created them (qadahunna) seven ,[heavens in two days" [۴۱:۱۱-۱۲

.that is, He created them – seven heavens – in two days

:Amr – 'command', as is proved by the saying of Allah, the Exalted .۲

And thy Lord has

N reads: fima dhakara Abu Ja‘far fi 'l-qada’ wa 'l-qadr, qala rahimahu allah -۱

,[decreed (qada’) that you worship none but Him [۱۷:۲۳

.that is, thy Lord has commanded

:I‘lam – 'informing', as is proved by the saying of Allah, the Exalted .۳

,[And we made known (qadayna) to the Children of Israel [ibid.:۴

that is We have informed them and told them about what is going to happen before it .comes into existence

:al-Fasl fi 'l-hukm – 'arbitration', as is proved by the saying of Allah, the Exalted .۴

[Allah judges (yaqdi) with justice [۴۰:۲۰

:that is, He will arbitrate between the two litigants. Also His saying,

,[And judgment (qudiya) shall be given between them with justice [۳۹:۷۵

.that is a judgment and arbitration will be given between them according to the right

It has been said that qada’ has a fifth meaning which signifies the completion of an affair (al-faragh mina 'l-amr), and called in evidence of this is the saying of Allah, :reporting the speech of Joseph

,[The matter on which you ask My opinion is decreed (qudiya) [۱۲:۴۱

that is, has been accomplished. However, this fifth meaning is synonymous with that .of creation

Now, if the above-mentioned meanings of qada’ are approved as the only correct ones, then the assumption of the Predestinarians that Allah ordained sin for mankind ,is invalid, because there are only four alternatives

i) either they mean that Allah has created sin in His creation; in that case they would) have to say He created sin in His creation, and not that He had imposed sin upon them, since creation (by the rules of

grammar) takes place in them (al-khalq fihim) and not upon them (la ‘alayhim). Even if this were not so, yet the Almighty

:Allah declared him a liar who alleges that Allah has created evil as He says

,[Everything that He created He made well [۳۲:۷

so He disclaims baseness in His creation and postulates its goodness, and .disobedience is unanimously held to be base

ii) Nor can they allege that 'He decreed sin' has the meaning of 'He commanded it',) :since Allah declared him a liar who upholds this, and the Almighty says

Verily Allah does not command indecency, do you say against Allah that which you do .[not know? [۷:۲۸

iii) It is equally absurd to conceive of qada’ in the sense that Allah had informed men) about it, since men do not know whether they will obey or rebel in the future, and they .have no detailed knowledge of what their conduct will be in the future

iv) Similarly, it is absurd to denote by qada bi 'dh-dhunub that Allah has decreed sin) for His creatures, since His decisions are all fair and right, and sin is from men alone; .also this statement is unanimously admitted absurd

Thus, it is self-evident that the assumption of those who attribute the creation of sin .to Allah is vain

The argument given above, concerning qada’ and qadar makes it easy to perceive the .correct doctrine on this question

We must admit that Allah holds – in some measure – destiny and decree over His creation

and over their actions. It is evident that we must understand by this, that qada’, in the context of their good actions, is that He commands them, and, in the context of their base actions, that He forbids them, and, in the context of men themselves, that He created them, and, in the context of what (they acquire by His deed), that He brought .it into existence for them

Similarly, by qudrah, in respect of the actions of the Almighty, its meaning should be understood as that He ordained it rightly and fittingly; and in respect of the actions of men that He commands good and forbids evil; and that He will reward or punish them. This is so because it is self-evident that whatever Allah has decreed is for the good of mankind and well-done; and far from frivolous. Thus, if Destiny and Decree, in speaking of the action of Allah, are interpreted as has been illustrated, then their obscurity will vanish and (what they mean) can be demonstrated, and the truth will become apparent to the intelligent and discussing them will not lead to corrupt .doctrine and to deviation

The interpretation of the reports concerning Al-Qada’ and Al-Qadar .۱۳

As for the reports which Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, relates concerning the prohibition of discussion of qada’ and qadar, they can bear two meanings: first, that the prohibition is restricted to those people whose discussions result in corrupt doctrine and divert them from the faith; for they will not keep their religion intact unless they

.refrain from discussion and abstain from indulging in it

Thus, the prohibition does not necessarily apply to all those who have reached years of discretion (mukallafin), since what is good for some might prove to be bad for others(۱) , *and, on the contrary, what is evil for some might be good for others(۲)* , and this demonstrates why the Imams, peace be upon them, endeavored to direct their followers in religion in accordance with what they knew to be in their best .interest

Secondly, discussion *of qada’ and qadar*(۳) is probably prohibited, regarding the reasons and causes of what Allah has created; and what He commands; and the religious duties He imposes; since the inquiry into, and asking for the causes and reasons of, creation and religious obligations are prohibited, because Allah, the .Exalted, has veiled these questions from the great majority of mankind

Do you not realize that no one is permitted to seek for the cause of the creation of all that has been created, in detail? And to ask, 'Why has He created this thing and that? Until he has enumerated all created things and accounted for them. Nor is anyone '?permitted to ask, 'Why did He command this? And impose that? And forbid the other

For His imposing this, and commanding that, is because He knows the best interests of His creation. Allah, the Almighty, has not disclosed to any of His creatures the particular causes for what He has created or commanded or imposed, notwithstanding

---

۱- N reads: la yasluhu bihi akharun.

۲- * * Not found in N.

۳- * * Not found in N.

that He has stated a priori that He did not create His creation lightly ('abath), but He did – indeed– create them with a wise purpose (li hikmah).

Yet, both reason and scripture (sam') support this. Allah says:

We created not the heaven and the earth, and whatsoever between them is, as though (we were) playing [۲۱:۱۶].

And He says:

Do you think that We created you only for sport [۲۳:۱۱۵].

And He says:

Surely We have created everything in measure [۵۴:۴۹],

that is, justly and fittingly. And He says:

And I have created jinn and men, only that they might serve Me [۵۱:۵۶].

And He says, concerning what He enjoins on us:

The flesh of them shall not reach Allah, neither blood, but piety shall reach Him from you [۲۲:۳۷].

Thus, it is likely that Allah, the Almighty, might create one particular animal to the end that it will cause some unbelievers (to believe); or it might lead some fornicators to repent; or that it might benefit some of the faithful; or that some evil-doers might take heed from it; or for the sheer benefit or the animal itself; or that it might serve as a warning to someone, whether in the earth or in the heavens, the aspects of which are all beyond our grasp and far from our comprehension, though we have to believe a priori that all that Allah has created is for a wise purpose and not for mere sport.

It is also possible that its

purpose is to draw us near to obedience to Him and to keep us from rebelliousness, and that service through prayer stands as a Divine favour either to all the worshipers, or to a few. Since all these hidden aspects of the Divine ordinances have been veiled from us, and since no authority exists for inquiring into it or asking for detailed explanation; though it is obligatory to believe that as a whole they have been created for a Divine purpose, hence it is forbidden to discuss qada' and qadar in the context .mentioned above

At any rate, the foregoing argument is necessary only if the reports related by Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, are approved sound; otherwise, if they are untrustworthy, then we are relieved of the duty of refuting it. As for the tradition which he related on the authority of Zurarah(۱) , it is the only sound one of them all, .and its meaning is obvious, and it is not difficult for the intelligent to comprehend

It confirms the soundness of the doctrine of the People of Justice (ahlu 'l-'adl), and demonstrates the falsity of the doctrine of the Predestinarians. Have you not understood and comprehended the tradition we related from Abu 'Abdillah, peace be upon him, "When Allah will collect or (assemble) men (creation) on the Day of Resurrection, He will ask them concerning what He had enjoined on them and will not "?question them concerning what He had des- tined for them

,Moreover

Zurarah ibn A'yan ash-Shaybani (d. ۱۵۰ AH): It is said that his real name was 'Abdu -۱ Rabbih, whereas Zurarah was his laqab. His kunyah wasAbu '۱-Hasan. He was one of the earliest distinguished Shi'ah divines and a remarkable theologian, jurist and traditionist. His father, Sunsun, is said to have been a Roman slave who was freed for his knowledge of the Qur'an, and his grandfather is said to have become a Christian Monk. He was highly honoured by Imam Ja'far as-Sadiq (a.s.), who said of him: "Had it not been for Zurarah, the traditions of my father would have been forgotten". The biographers ascribe to him, among other works, a theologi- cal tract called al Jabr wa

'l-istita‘ah. See Ibnu 'n-Nadim, al-Fihrist, p.۲۲۰; at-Tusi, Rijali 'sh-Shi‘ah, p.۱۲۳; al-Kishshi, ar-Rijal, p.۸۸; an-Najashi, al- Fihrist, p.۱۲۵, adh-Dhahabi, Mizanu 'l-i‘tidal, vol.۲, p.۶۹, no.۲۸۵۳; al- Mamaqani, Tanqihu 'l-maqal, vol.I, p.۴۳۸, no.۴۲۱۳.

the Qur’an declares emphatically that men are responsible for their actions, so if their actions were decreed from Allah, then He never would ask them about it, which demonstrates that the eternal decree means the 'creation of their things', and what this entails is that Allah the Almighty will ask them only concerning what He enjoined on them in commanding them to do good deeds and to abstain from evil. Thus, according to this reasoning the tradition mentioned above is an illustration supporting .the foregoing explanation of qada’ and qadar which is comprehensible

(The Natural Religion (Al-Fitrah .۱۴

Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says, concern- ing the natural religion, that "Allah has undoubtedly created man with a disposition towards (accepting) the ."(Unity of Allah (tawhid

ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, adds that Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, mentions fitrah without expounding its meaning, and he related the tradition without referring to its implications. The explicit meaning of his saying (i.e., Imam Ja‘far as-Sadiq, peace be upon him), "Allah has created men", is that He brought them into existence in the beginning (ibtada'ahum bi 'l-huduth), .hence fitrah means to create

:Allah, the Almighty, says

[Praise belongs to Allah, Originator of the heavens and earth [۳۵:۱

which means the Creator of the heavens and earth in the beginning and for the time :to come. He also says

,[Allah's pattern (lit. origin) upon which He modelled mankind [۳۰:۳۰

which means design on the basis of (or proto-type upon) which He

created mankind. And this is what as-Sadiq, peace be upon him, meant by his saying: "Allah has created men with a disposition towards accepting the Unity of Allah", which also signifies that Allah created them to affirm His Unity and that they should hold Him .One

Yet this does not imply that He willed them to accept His Unity, because if He did so, then the whole of mankind would be monotheists (muwahhidun), where- as we see among ourselves those who are not, a. fact which indicates that the Almighty has not decreed monotheism for mankind; rather He has created them to acquire it (through :their own endeavour) – a fact which can be supported by the speech of Allah

,[I have not created jinn and mankind except to worship Me [۵۱:۵۶

.which plainly demonstrates that He has created them to worship Him

He (Abu Ja‘far) also has related a tradition which is accepted as genuine both by al-‘Ammah and al-Khassah[۱] (lit. the generality and elect) which runs thus, "Every infant is born according to the fitrah, then his parents make him a Jew or a Christian"[۲] , which also confirms the explanation mentioned above, which states that Allah has created mankind to serve Him and with the disposition to affirm His Unity, hence whatsoever errors they commit on their own originate only from them- selves .and from the delusion of jinn and man with nothing from Allah

As for the interpretation, Abu Ja‘far brings forward concerning Allah's right guidance to

---

۱ - The Shi‘ah theologians call themselves al-Khassah, whereas they denote by .al-‘Ammah the Sunnites generally

۲ - See al-Bukhari, as-Sahih, tafsir of surah ۳۰; Muslim, as-Sahih, Kitabu 'l- Qadar, .Tradition no.۲۲

men, this states the case exactly, and he has followed the ideal course. And what he has mentioned is in accordance with the principle of Divine Justice, and approved by reason, and is contrary to what the Predestinarians maintain, who contradict the .speech of Allah and what is approved sound by reason

(Concerning Human Capacity (Al –Istita'Ah .۱۵

Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says concern- ing human capacity, that our belief in this (question) is what Imam Musa ibn Ja'far, peace be upon both of them, said that "A human being has capacity, provided he possesses four "...characteristics

Abu 'Abdillah adds that what Abu Ja'far relates from Abu 'l-Hasan Musa, peace be upon him, on al-istita'ah, is a shadhdh tradition. Al-Istita'ah, that is, capacity for action, in fact, consists of health and soundness of limb. Thus, every healthy man is a capable agent, and becomes impotent and deprived of capacity only when he is not in possession of health. He would be a capable agent even if he were not in possession .of the instrument necessary for the performance of the action

Then in that case, he is a capable agent impeded from action, and being impeded does not nullify the capacity, but merely the action. In this way a man might be able to :marry, though he has not found a woman to marry. Allah, the Exalted, says

,[And whoever among you cannot afford to marry free believing women . . . [۴:۲۵

which states that a man is able to marry though he

has not yet married, and that he is capable of performing the pilgrimage before doing .so, and is capable of going out in the Holy War although he has not done so

:Allah Almighty says

And they will swear by Allah, if we had been able, we would have gone out with you ,[(Muhammad) [۹:۴۲

which indicates that they were able to go forth, though they refrained from doing so. :And He, the Exalted, says

Pilgrimage to the House is a duty which men owe to Allah, every man who is able to .[make his way thither [۳:۹۷

Thus, He prescribed pilgrimage for men, which implies that they possessed the capacity for it beforehand. Then how could Abu Ja'far claim that fornication is dependent on the presence of the woman; whereas we have demonstrated that a man possesses the capacity although he lacks her presence. Hence, if the tradition related by Abu Ja'far is proved to be sound, then the only meaning of the capacity is to .facilitate the action and pave the way for it

Yet, as we demonstrated, the absence of the means does not involve impotency, and capacity exists in spite of the impediment. Since this subject is a controversial one, and if we deal with it at length it will be long drawn out indeed, then what we have .established about it is sufficient to the intelligent

’Concerning Al–bada .۱۶

"...’Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: "Our belief concerning al-bada

Abu 'Abdillah comments that the

belief of the Imamiyyah concerning al-bada' is approved by textual proof (sam') rather than reason, and further affirmed by the narrations related on the authority of the divinely guided Imams, peace be upon them. Originally, al-bada' means emerging .((circumstances

:Allah says

But there would appear to them from Allah that on which they had not reckoned ,[[۳۹:۴۷

which signifies that the retribution which Allah has prepared for them, and which they :had not taken into account or consideration. And He says

There would appear to them and surround them the evils of what they have amassed .[[۳۹:۴۸

That is, they will be confronted with the recompense which they have earned, and .that this will be made plain to them

The Arabs used to say, "bada li fulan 'amal hasan", that is, it appeared to him as a praiseworthy act. And also, "bada lahu kalam fasih", that is, it seems to him an eloquent speech. Also they .say, "bada min fulan kadha" – in some case the (lam) may be substituted for (min). It will then read, "bada li fulan". The interpretation of what the Imamiyyah meant by: "bada li Allah fi kadha", is that something about (a particular thing) appeared to Him, the meaning of 'something about it appeared to Allah" is that .something (i.e., a particular statement) about it emerged from Him

This is not to imply an amendment of opinion (on the part of the Almighty), or that the ,heart of the matter, from being unintelligible, has been made plain to Him

since all the works of Allah (which are now) apparent in His creation, although (at one time) not in existence, were always known to Him from eternity. Then the term bada' can only apply to things which are unexpected or the occurrence of which was not taken into account, and can never apply to what was known to Him as bound to .happen

As for the saying of Abu 'Abdillah, peace be upon him:"Allah has never been influenced by a new consideration, as in the case of my son Isma'il"(۱), he meant by this what Allah did for him in shielding him by abolishing the decree of death, al- though it was feared and expected for him; yet Allah responded favorably to his petition by .withholding this

The reports related on his authority, "that death was decreed for Isma'il twice, but I requested Allah to abolish it and He did", supports this. Nevertheless, there may be a :decree which is suspended and may be changed in certain cases; Allah says

,[And He has decreed a term for you, and a term is fixed with Him [۶:۲

which makes it clear that there are two different sorts of terms of which one is conditional (liable to change), and might be lengthened or shortened, as may be seen :in the saying of Allah

And no one groweth old who groweth old, nor is aught lessened of his life, but it is .[recorded in a book [۳۵:۱۱

:And His saying

And if the people of

۱- Isma'il ibn Ja'far as-Sadiq: The eldest son of the sixth Imam, His father at first nominated him as his successor to the imamate, but later on deposed him from this position because of his excessive addiction to drink. Though he died five years before his father at Medina in ۱۴۳/۷۶۰-۱, and though his body was publicly exposed and his

death attested to by numerous witnesses, many among his followers held that he survived his father and ascribed to him many miraculous acts. The Seveners (as-Sab'iyyah), that is, the Isma'iliyyah sect of the Shi'ah, with its various offshoots, derives its name from him. See al-Maqrizi, Itti'azu 'l-hunafa', vol.I, p.١۶; Ibnu '١-Jawzi, Talbis Iblis, p.١٠٢; an-Nawbakhti, Firaqu 'sh- Shi'ah, p.٣۵; ash-Shahristani, al-Milal, vol.٢, p.۵; Lewis, B., The Origins of Isma'ilism, p.٣٨; E.I., the article "Isma'il ibn Ja'far", by Huart, C.H., vol.٢, i, p.۵۴٩. [This view has been quoted from the non-Imamite sources, but for the right opinion concerning Isma'il and his life history see our "Introduction" to the English translation of Kitab al-Irshad which will be published by the Will of Allah (ed.).]

the township had believed and kept from evil, surely We should have showered them .[with blessing from the heaven and from the earth [۷:۹۶

These verses demonstrate plainly that their terms were conditional, being lengthened in accordance with righteousness and cut short on account of evil. Allah Almighty, :reporting the speech of Noah, peace be upon him, says

Ask forgiveness of your Lord; surely, He is ever forgiving, He will send down upon you .[rain pouring in abundance [۷۱:۱۰-۱۱

So He made the length of their term and also the showering of His favour conditional upon their sincere contrition; then, when they failed (in this), He cut short their term and annihilated them. Thus, (the reasoned argument given above) affirms that bada’ is concerned only with what is a conditional decree, and never involves a change of mind from one decision to another, or the mutability of opinion – Allah is Exalted far .above what the liars allege

Nonetheless, some of our companions asserted that originally bada’ designated the amendment of opinion, and the change of mind from one particular decision to another, and that it applied to Allah only in its metaphorical sense, in the same manner as 'anger' and 'pleasure' were applied to Him metaphorically. Yet this assertion does not harm our School, since metaphorical nouns can be applied to Allah if they are mentioned in Scripture (lit. authorized by sam‘, that is, textual proof), and .bada’ is, as we have demonstrated, one of these mentioned in Scripture

What

was approved by us in our interpretation was that it has the meaning of 'emerging', as we demonstrated above, and it means merely the emergence of what was unexpected and extraordinary, since, if it comes to be generalized so as to cover each one of the particular actions of Allah, then it will involve the attribution of mutability to Allah, and this is unanimously held to be absurd.

۱۷. Concerning Religious Disputation (Al-Jidal)

Abu Ja'far says, concerning disputation: "Disputation concerning Allah is prohibited, because it leads to that which does not befit Him"; then he quoted as-Sadiq, peace be upon him, as saying: "The speculative theologians (ahlu 'l-kalam) will perish, and those who accept the faith without question will be saved."

Abu 'Abdillah ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, comments that: Disputation is of two kinds; true (i.e., a sincere quest after the truth) and false (i.e., discussion without the object of arriving at the truth or merely to find fault).

The true disputation is recommended and desirable; whereas the false one is prohibited, and indulgence in it is abhorred. Allah, the Almighty, admonishing His Messenger, says:

And argue with them in the best manner [۱۶:۱۲۵],

which obviously states the legality of arguing with opponents in order to convince them, since the disputation of the Prophet was true. Also Allah, the

Almighty, addressing the whole Muslim community, says:

And argue not with the People of the Book except by what is best [۲۹:۴۶].

Thus, He permitted them to argue with the People of the Book

.with what is best, and prohibited indulgence in false and base disputation with them

He, the Exalted, reporting the speech of the people of Noah, peace be upon him, in ,their disputation says: They said

.[O Noah! indeed you have disputed with us and prolonged dispute with us" [۱۱:۳۲"

Thus, if disputation was altogether vain, then Allah, the Almighty, would never have commanded His Prophet to adopt it, or the prophets before him to use it, and would .not have allowed the Muslims to employ it

As for the false disputation, Allah, the Almighty, the Belessed, has described it in His :saying

Have you not seen those who dispute (foolishly) about the signs of Allah, how they .[distort them? [۴۰:۶۹

Thus, He reproached their false disputation concerning the signs of Allah, either to reject or to vilify them, or to cast suspicion on them. He, the Exalted, also reports the controversy of His friend, Ibrahim, with an unbeliever (concerning the existence of :Allah) and says

.[Have not you thought of him who disputed with Ibrahim about his Lord [۲:۲۵۸

:Also, reporting his refutation of his opponents, He says

And that is Our argument, which We gave Ibrahim as against his people, We raise up .[in degrees whom We will [۶:۸۳

Also, commanding His Prophet (Muhammad), peace be upon him and his progeny, to :argue with. his opponents, He says

.[Say: "Have you any knowledge, for you to bring forth for us?" [۶:۱۴۸

:And He, Exalted be His Name, says

All food

,[was lawful to the Children of Israel [۳:۹۳

:and telling His Prophet, says

Whoever then disputes with thee in this matter after the knowledge that has come to .[thee [۳:۶۱

Moreover, the Imams still continued to debate the religion of Allah, and the learned amongst their followers in every age used to rely on sound argument and reasoned proofs in their polemics, in order to establish the truth and refute the false, and the Imams always praised them for that, and appreciated their efforts highly in this .respect

Chapter: al-Kulayni(۱) , may Allah have mercy upon him, relates in his book, al-Kafi, which is one of the most admirable books of the Shi'ah, the discussion Yunus ibn Ya'qub(۲) had with Abu 'Abdillah, peace be upon him, when the Shami(۳) came to .dispute with him

Abu 'Abdillah said to him: "O Yunus! I wish that you had mastered speculative theology (kalam)"; thereupon Yunus replied: "May I be made your ransom! I have heard that you have forbidden people to dispute and that you have said; 'Woe unto those who indulge in dialectics, who say this is a tenable proposition and this is not, '.this consistent, and this not, and this is conceivable and this is not

Then Abu 'Abdillah said: "I called woe upon them if they abandoned my teaching and" clung to what is opposite to it." Then he asked Humran ibn A'yan(۴) , Muhammad ibn at- Tayyar (۵) , Hisham ibn Salim(۶) and Qays al-Masir(۷) to hold a debate before him and

---

۱- Muhammad ibn Ya'qub ibn Ishaq al-Kulayni ar-Razi: He is known as Abu Ja'far, the compiler of the great compendium of Shi'ite traditions, al- Kafi fi 'ilmi 'd-din, which occupies in Shi'ism a position analogous with that of the Sahih, of al-Bukhari among

the Sunnis. It was his life-work and took twenty years to compile. He is called, in recognition of his diligence in collecting Shi'ite traditions, the Trustworthy authority of Islam "Thiqatu'l-Islam", (In respect to Thiqatu 'l-Islam al-Kulayni and the book of al-Kafi, see our two introductions to the English translation of al-Kafi at the beginning of the "The Book of Reason and Ignorance" [ed.])al-Kulayni was born porbably before ۲۶۰/۸۴۷, and died in Baghdad in Sha'ban, ۳۲۹ AH (May, ۹۴۱ AD). For a critical and detailed account of his life and work see Ivanow, W., The Alleged Founder of Isma'ilism, pp.ll-۲۷. Also, the "Introduction" to the new edition of al-Kafi by Dr. Husayn'Ali Mahfuz (Tehran, ۱۳۸۱ AH). an-Najashi, op. cit. p.۲۶۶; at-Tusi, op. cit., p.۴۹۵; al-Mamaqani, op. cit., vol.۳, p.۲۱۱, no.۱۱۵۴۰.

۲- Yunus ibn Ya'qub ibn Qays: His kunyah was Abu 'Ali al-Jallab. He wascontemporary with both as-Sadiq, the sixth Imam, and his son, al-Kazim (a.s.). He was highly esteemed by the Shi'ah for his profound knowledge of fiqh. The Shi'ah biographers honour him for being the author of a book on pilgrimage, which is counted among the Four Hundred Principle Books. He died during the imamate of the Eighth Imam, 'Ali ibn Musa ar-Rida (۲۰۳/ ۸۱۸). See an-Najashi, op. cit., p.۳۱۱; al-Kishshi, op. cit., p.۲۴۵; at- Tusi, op. cit., p.۳۳۵; al-Mamaqani, op. cit., vo۱.۳, p.۳۴۴, no.۱۳۳۶۵.

۳- ۲۴ For more detail concerning this debate, see al-Kulayni, al-Kafi, vol.l ,p.۱۷۱; al-Mamaqani, op. cit., vol.l, p.۳۷۱.

۴- Humran ibn A'yan ash-Shaybani: His kunyah is variously reported as Abu '۱-Hasan or Abu Hamzah. He was a distinguished traditionist and jurist. He was contemporary with both Imams, al-Baqir and as-Sadiq (a.s.),and was highly respected by the latter, of whom it is reported that he said:"Humran is one of our company both in this world and the world here- after". He also promised him paradise for his intimacy with the Family of the Prophet, and his staunch defence of the Shi'ah tenets. Opinions differ concerning his trustworthiness, thus, while the Shi'ah authorities generally praised him and accepted him as a reliable transmitter, the orthodox were split; some discarded his reports, others accepted them as genuine and reliable. See al-Kishshi, op. cit., p.۱۱۷; at-Tusi, op. cit., p.۱۱۷; al-Mamaqani, op. cit., vol.l, pp.۳۷۰-۲, no.۳۳۵۱; adh-Dhahabi, Mizanu 'l-i'tidal, vol.۱, p.۶۰۴, no.۲۲۹۲; Ibn Hajar, Tahdhibu 't-tahdhib, vo۱.۳, p.۲۵, no.۳۲; Ibnu'n-Nadim, al-Fihrist, p.۲۲۰.

۵- Muhammad ibn 'Abdillah ibn at-Tayyar: A follower of the Fifth ImamMuhammad al-

Baqir (a.s.). He was known as a dialectic theologian and a reciter of the Qur'an. See al-Kishshi, op. cit., pp.۲۲۲-۳; at-Tusi, op. cit., pp.۱۳۵-۲۹۲; al-Mamaqani, op. cit., vol.۳, p.۱۳۴, .no.۱۰۸۹۵

See al-Kafi, "Introduction" to "The Book of Divine Unity", (Eng. transl.),published by -۶ .WOFIS, Tehran

Qays al-Masir: The famous Shi'ah theologian and traditionist, who lived during the -۷ first half of the second century of the hijrah. He was an intimateassociate of the Fourth Imam, 'Ali ibn al-Husayn (d. ۹۲/۷۱۰-۱), from whom, it is said, he acquired skill in disputation. He relates many tradit- ions on the authority of as-Sadiq (a.s.). See al-.Mamaqani, op. cit., vol.۲, p.۳۳, no.۹۷۲۸; al-'Amili, A'yanu 'sh-Shi'ah, vol.I, pt.۲, p.۷۷

afterwards Hisham[1] (ibn al-Hakam) came forward with his thesis (lit. apology); then :the Imam praised him and congratulated him, and said

It is you who can dispute with the people." Also, (it has been related) that when he" heard of the death of at-Tayyar, he said: "May Allah have mercy upon him and show him splendor and happiness; indeed, he was vigorous in his defence of us, the People of the House." Abu 'l-Hasan Musa ibn Ja'far, peace be upon him, said to Muhammad :(ibn Hakim[2]

Dispute with the people and disclose the truth which you are following, and make" clear the error into which they are fallen." Abu 'Abdillah (Ja'far as- Sadiq), peace be upon him, said to some of our companions: "Debate with the people with my argument, and if they overcome you by argument, it will be I who am controverter, ".not you

Also, he said to Hisham ibn al-Hakam, after he had answered his question concerning the Names of the Almighty and their etymology: "Have you comprehended what I have explained to you to such an extent that you would be able to refute our heretical .opponents and make their polemics of no effect?" "Yes," answered Hisham

Then the Imam said: "May Allah help you". He also admonished a group of his followers and said: "Explain to the people the guidance which follow and show them the evils to which they adhere, and initiate (bahilhum fi 'Ali) discussion with them concerning 'Ali." Thus, the report displays that

---

See al-Kafi, "Introduction" to "The Book of Divne Unity", (Eng. transl.),published by -۱ .WOFIS, Tehran

Muhammad ibn Hakim al-Kath'ami: His kunyah was Abu Ja'far. He was associated -۲ with both as-Sadiq and his son al-Kazim (a.s.). See at-Tusi,op. cit., p.۳۱۶; an-Najashi, .op. cit., p.۲۰۵; al-Mamaqani, op. cit., vo۱.۳, p.۱۰۹, no.۱۰۶۲۴

he (Ja'far as-Sadiq) encouraged them to dispute with others, and he admonished them to comprehend the methods of disputation, and recommended them to exert themselves in learning it.

It has been related also that he (the Imam) once forbade a man to dispute whereas he commanded another to exert himself in acquiring this art: there-upon, some of his followers asked him: "May I be made your ransom! Why have you commanded one of them to master disputation whereas you forbade it to other?" He answered: "Because the first has a keen insight into the matter and is more informed about it than the other."

Thus, the argument mentioned above confirms the fact that for the two sadiqs (i.e., the two veracious imams, Muhammad al-Baqir and his son, Ja'far as-Sadiq), prohibition only applies to a particular group of those who are not well-versed in it, and are uninformed in its methods, and whom dialectics confuse; and it (i.e., kalam) is commanded for the other group who have perfected it and mastered its methods.

As for the prohibition of disputation applied to Allah, this is, in fact, limited to discussion regarding the drawing of comparison between Him and His creation, and also charging Him with injustice. But as for discussion about Allah's unity and the denial of His resem- blance to His creation and the affirmation of His transcendence and His glory, there are many traditions and narrations commanding and encouraging it.

Some of these evidences I have recorded in my book al-Arkan

fi da‘aimi 'd-din, and I also wrote a comprehensive chapter in my book al-Kamil fi ‘ulumi'ddin. Also, on this subject, my book ‘Uqudu'd-din, contains a section; he who depends on it can dispense with everything else. Then it is self-evident that whosoever denies insight and reasoning bears witness to the weakness of his own opinion, and this displays his deficiencies in seeking knowledge and indicates his fall .from the ranks of people of perception

Also, we should discriminate between nazar and munazarah, (i.e., 'insight' and 'disputation'), since it is permissible some- times to restrain people from doctrinal disputation for the sake of their self-preservation (at-taqiyyah)(۱) , whereas it is not permissible, in any circumstances, to forbid them reasoning and insight; because to restrain them from exercising reason is to pave the way to blind imitation, which is sharply criticized by the unanimous opinion of the learned divines, as also by the plain .text of the Qur’an and Tradition

Allah, the Almighty, reporting the speech of the unbelievers, and reproaching their :blind imitation says

Lo! We found our fathers upon a com- munity, and we are following upon their" ,[traces." [۴۳:۲۲

:and also He, the Exalted, says

And the Warner said:) "What! even though I bring you a better guidance than you) .[found your fathers following" [ibid.: ۲۴

al-Imam as-Sadiq, peace be upon him, says: "He who takes his faith from the mouth of men, men will make him slip (from the truth), but he who takes his faith from the Book and Tradition

---

.See p.۹۲ -۱

".(will never slip though mountains may slip (from their positions

:Also, he says

Beware of blind imitation, because he who follows others blindly in his religion will be" destroyed, since Allah says: They have taken as lords their Rabbis and their Monks .[[۹:۳۱

By Allah they have never prayed for them nor fasted for their sake, but they declared lawful what was forbidden and considered forbidden for them what was lawful and they followed them blindly in what they enjoyed and what they forbade, and therefore, they worshipped them unconsciously(۱) . And he says: "He who responds to a Warner has worshipped him, then if he was sent by Allah he has worshipped Allah, ".and if he was from Satan, then he has worshipped Satan

The logical conclusion of our argument, then is that) if blind imitation was approved) and insight was vain, then to imi- tate one group is no more praiseworthy than to imitate another, and also, whoever erred through imitation would have been excused, .and whoever follows an innovator would not have sinned

But this is an assumption which no one (endowed with reason) would assert; thus, it is a self-evident fact that reasoned speculation is right, and sincere disputation is approved, and as for the traditions which Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, related their true interpretation is the one which we have put forward, and the real .meaning is not what he has imagined. And Allah is the truest supporter

p

(The belief concerning the tablet and the pen (Al-Lawh Wa 'L-Qalam .۱۸

Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far, may Allah

.al-Kulayni, al-Kafi, "Babu 't-Taqlid", vol.I, p.۵۳ -۱

have mercy upon him, says: "Our belief concerning the Tablet and the Pen is that they are two angels."ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, adds that the Tablet is the Book of Almighty Allah in which He has written all that will be till the Day :of Resurrection. In the Qur’an we have

And We have written in the Psalms after the reminder, verily, my righteous servants .[shall inherit the earth [۲۱:۱۰۵

Thus, the Tablet means 'the reminder' (dhikr). 'Pen' isthe name of that thing by whose instrumentality Allah has caused the writing on the Tablet. Hence, Allah has ordained the Tablet to serve as an original record, through which the angels, peace be upon them, acquire the knowledge of what is going to happen concerning what is hidden .and what is inspired

When Allah intended to acquaint the angels with some secret of His, or send a revelation (through them) to one of the prophets, peace be upon them, He commands them to consult the Tablet, and from this they memorize the ordinances which are to be communicated to those to whom they have been sent, and thus they are informed .of what they have to do

This interpretation, more- over, was confirmed by the reports related on the authority of the Prophet and the Imams, peace be upon them all. As for those who maintained that the Tablet and the Pen are two angels, they have indeed deviated from the truth, since angels cannot be called tablets

or pens, and since there are no linguistic precedents for an angel or human being .called tablet or pen

(The Metaphysical Meaning of the Throne (Al–'Arsh .۱۹

ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: "Our belief concerning the Throne is that it is the support of the whole creation."(۱)ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him,comments poet says: that 'Throne' linguistically means 'kingdom': the When the dominion of Banu Marwan shall have departed,and been effaced as were Iyad and Himyar,which means when the kingdom of Banu Marwan .(the Umay- yids) is destroyed and they are effaced

Another says: "Do you think that your throne will never vanish or change?", which means, 'Do you think that your kingdom will never vanish or change?' Allah, the Almighty, relating the speech of those who describe the kingdom of the Queen of :Sheba says

,[She has been given of everything, and she possesses a mighty throne [۲۷:۲۳

.which means that she has got a mighty kingdom

Then it follows from this that the Throne of Allah, the Almighty, is His Kingdom, and seating Himself upon the Throne is equiv- alent to establishing His sovereignty over His Kingdom. The Arabs often substitute istiwa', that is, seating oneself upon, for .istila', that is, to take possession of

:The poet says

,Bishr has seated himself on Iraq

,without recourse to sword or bloodshed

which means that he has dominated Iraq. As for the Throne ('arsh) which is carried by angels, it is only a portion of the Kingdom of Allah, and it is a Throne which

۱- T, hamalat jami‘i 'l-khalq: N, jumlat jami‘i 'l-khalq. Prof. Fyzee (A Shi‘ite Creed, Note no.III) reads jumlat for hamalat. However, hamalat is more in keeping with the chapter and what is generally held by the Shi‘ah traditionists, concerning al-‘Arsh. See al-Ash‘ari, Maqalatu 'l-Islamiyyin, vol.I, p.۳۵.

Allah created in the seventh heaven which is carried by angels in adoration and glorification of Allah; as He has erected a house on the earth (i.e., Ka‘bah) and commanded man to make it their goal, visit it and perform the pilgrimage to it and .glorify it

It has been handed down in tradition that Allah Almighty has created a house beneath the Throne and called it al-Baytu 'l-Ma‘mur (i.e., the ever-prosperous house), to which the angels make their pilgrimage every year. Also, He established a house in the fourth heaven and named it ad-Durah, to which the angels, in obeisance to Allah, make their pilgrimage, venerate it, and accomplish the circumambulation of it; and He .created al- Baytu 'l-Haram on the earth and placed it beneath ad-Durah

It has been related that as-Sadiq, peace be upon him, has said: "If a stone were to be thrown down from the ‘arsh it would fall on the back of al-Baytu 'l-Ma‘mur, and if it were to be thrown from al-Baytu 'l-Ma‘mur, it would fall on the back of al-Baytu'l-Haram." (Thus it is self-evident) that Allah, the Exalted, has not created a Throne for Himself to settle in (Allah is Exalted far above that!), but He created the Throne and appropriated it to Himself to increase its greatness and glory, and required His angels .to make obeisance in bearing it

Also, He established a House on earth which He has not created for Himself, nor that He should dwell therein; Allah is Exalted far

above that – but He created it for His creation and appropriated it to Himself that they should honour and venerate it, and He required them to visit it and make pilgrimage .to it as obeisance to Him

As for the description of ‘ilm (knowledge) as ‘arsh, it is purely metaphorical. Therefore, :it is not justifiable to interpret the meaning of the speech of Allah, the Almighty

,[The All-com- passionate sat Himself upon the Throne [۲۰:۵

in the sense that He is the Omniscient. The only rational interpretation is the one we .put forward above

As for the traditions related about the angels as being bearers of the Throne, they are all ahad traditions, and based upon the authority of a single narrator. Hence, the reports can- not be allowed as genuine, nor can they be used as a basis for practice. .Yet it is more reasonable to hold a non-committal view about them

Then it is obvious that the only tenable doctrine is that 'Throne' means kingdom, and that the ‘arsh which is carried by angels is only a portion of the Kingdom (mulk), by the .bearing of which Allah ordered angles to make obeisance to Him

(Concerning Souls and Spirits (Al-Arwah wa 'n-Nufus .۲۰

ash-Shaykh Abu Ja‘far says: "Our belief concerning souls is that they are spirits, and that they were the first of created things; and that they were created for eternal existence; and that they bodies."are strangers in the earth and imprisoned in their
ash-Shaykh Abu ‘Abdillah says that Abu Ja‘far's discussion of souls and spirits

is based upon conjecture with no scientific investigation. It would have been wiser had he contented himself with the mere mention of the reports, without involving .himself in intricacies of inner meaning, since he is not well- equipped for such a task

:As for 'soul'(١), it has different meanings

;(’l. The essence of a thing (dhatu 'sh-shay

;(The moving blood (ad-damu 's-sail .٢

;(The breath which is the wind (an-nafas .٣

.(Desire and passion (al-hawa .۴

Now, the proof of the first meaning is the saying: "This is the very thing itself, that is, its essence and it itself." And the proof of the second meaning is the saying: "Whatsoever is classified as an animal with circulating blood is to be judged thus and thus." And the proof of the third meaning is the saying: "So-and-so has perished, if he ".ceases to breathe and no air remains in his body to inflate his lungs

;And the proof of the fourth meaning is the speech of Allah

,[Surely, the soul of man incites to evil [١٢:۵٣

which means passion instigates evil. Soul (nafs) might designate the meaning of :retribution, the proof of which is the saying of Allah, the Almighty

,[And Allah biddeth you beware of Him (nafsahu) [٣:٢٨

'.which means 'of His retribution and punishment

:Ruh (i.e., Spirit), also has several meaning

;(Life (hayat .١

;Qur’an .٢

;(A particular one of the angels of the Almighty Allah (malak .٣

.Jibril .۴

Now, the proof of the first meaning is the saying: "Everything that is classified as being endued with spirit is to be judged

---

N reads, qala ash-Shaykh Abu ‘Abdillah ‘alayhi 'r-rahmah, amma 'n-nafs -۱

thus and thus," by which they mean every being that has life, and their saying in respect of him who died, "he gave up the Ghost", (lit. the spirit went out of him), which means his life. And the same is their description of the embryo, "a form not endued with spirit", which means that it lacks life.

And the proof of the second meaning is the speech of Allah:

[So We have revealed to thee a spirit of Our command [۴۲:۵۲],

which means here the Qur'an. And the proof of the third meaning is the speech of the Almighty:

[Upon the day when the spirit and the angels stand in ranks [۷۸:۳۸].

And the proof of the fourth meaning is the saying of the Almighty: Say,

"[The Holy Spirit has revealed it" [۱۶:۱۰۲],

that is, Jibril, peace be upon him.

As for the narrations which Abu Ja'far reports, that souls were created two thousand years before the bodies; and that those of them who were acquainted with each other are intimate, and those who were strangers to each other are disparate(۱) , it is, in fact, an ahad tradition and a report unsupported except by one narrator.

Nevertheless, it bears an interpretation which differs from that adopted by those who are not acquainted with the fact of the matter. Hence, the sound interpretation is that Allah, the Exalted, created the angels two thousand years before mankind; then those amongst them who were acquainted with each other before the creation of men

---

۱- See al-Bukhari, as-Sahih, "Kitabu 'l-Anbiya'", "Babu 'l-arwah junud mujan- nadah", no.۱; Muslim, as-Sahih, "Kitabu 'l-birr wa 's-silah wa 'l-adab". Tradition no.۱۵۹.

;are also intimate after the creation of men

whereas those among them who were strangers to each other before, are also strangers after the creation of men. Then, the reality is far from what is maintained by .the adherents of transmigration

This specious doctrine has crept into the Hashwites in the ranks of the Shi‘ah; who erroneously alleged that our beings which are subject to the commands and prohibitions of Allah were created in the world of atoms (‘alamu 'dh- dhar), and that they were acquainted with each other and endued with the faculties of discernment, comprehension and speech; then Allah created bodies for them after that and put .them together

Do they not realize) that if this were so, then we would know the state which we) occupied before, and that if it were recalled to us, we would remember it and nothing of it would be hidden from us? Do you not realize that if someone was brought up in a place and settled there for a year, and then turned away from it to a second place, he will never forget what he knows about it; and that if he forgets it through absent- ?mindedness, it would be easy for him to remember it if he was reminded of it

If this was so, then would it be probable that one of us, who was born in Baghdad and settled there for twenty years and then immigrated to another place, would forget all that happened to him at Baghdad

even if he were reminded of it in detail? In fact, this is an assumption which no one .endowed with reason will make

It would have been wiser for those who are not well-equip- ped for such a task to deal with the subject without applying any discussion. What Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, maintained about spirits and souls is unwittingly the actual doctrine of transmigration. So, he committed a fearful crime against himself and .others

As for his opinion regarding the perpetuity of the soul, it is, indeed, a statement to be castigated, since it contradicts the plain meaning of the Qur’an. Allah, the Almighty, :says

All that dwells upon the earth is transient, and none endures for ever but the Face of .[thy Lord, Majestic, and Splendid [۵۵:۲۶-۲۷

Thus, what he narrated and erroneously assumed is, in fact, the doctrine of the majority of the heretical philosophers who maintain the eternity of the soul and its incorruptibility and perpetuity, and advocate the opinion that the soul abides, and that .it is only the body that undergoes degeneration and corruption

The same opinion was held by some of the adherents of transmigration, who claim that souls recur perpetually in different forms and bodies, and that neither are they contingent nor will they corrupt or be annihilated. This is one of the most monstrous claims and far removed from the truth. Comparable to it in wickedness and error is the charge of the Nasibah(۱) (that)(۲) these are the real

---

۱- -Nawasib: An appelation used by the Shi‘ah to designate those who refuse any pre-eminence to ‘Ali ibn Abi Talib (a.s.), sometimes applied to the orthodox indiscriminately. Friedlaender, I., says that "Originally, Nawasib stood for the exact reverse of Rawafid: the 'enemies' or 'haters' of ‘Ali, and was confined to the extreme Kharijites. Gradually, its meaning expanded so that it finally embraced all the

Sunnites, however far they were from hating ‘Ali." (The Heterodoxies of the Shi‘ites in the Presentation of Ibn Hazm, vol.۲, p.۱۵۶). See also, Ibn Manzur, Lisanu 'l-‘Arab, vol.l, p.۷۶۲.

۲- T, shana‘a bihi 'n Nasibah; N, ma shana‘a . . .

.doctrines of all the Shi'ah; on the strength of which they brand them with heresy

Thus, if those who gave authority to such traditions had been aware of the dangers that lay in them, they would never have affirmed them. However, the indiscriminating of our companions, who are incapable of accurate judgment and sound comprehension, often accept the traditions at their face value without checking their authority, and do not distinguish between the true and the absurd without realizing what follows from accepting them or comprehending the real meaning of what they .affirm

What has been affirmed by (genuine) traditions in this respect is that souls after death are of two kinds: those which proceed to reward or punishment; and those which are .abolished and therefore known neither reward nor punishment

A tradition has been related from as-Sadiq, peace be upon him, which confirms and clarifies this interpretation. He was asked: "What will happen to the spirit of the dead? and where will it abide?" He replied: "The dead are of two categories: (a) either purely faithfully, or (b) purely wicked; then the spirits of each passes from his body (lit. .house-haykal) to its like, and each is rewarded for its acts till the Day of Resurrection

On the Day of Ressurrection Allah will restore his body and insert his spirit into it, and call him to accept the final judgment for his deeds. The spirit of the faithful will pass from his dead body to a similar form, and abide in

.a paradise of Allah, where he will enjoy a perpetual grace till the Day of Resurrection

But the unbeliever's spirit will pass to a form similar to itself and abide in fire and torture till the Day of Resurrection. And that this is the lot of the believer is proved by :the speech of Allah: It was said: "Enter paradise". He said

.[Ah! Would my people had knowledge that my Lord has forgiven me . . ." [۳۶:۲۶-۲۷"

And that the unbeliever's state is as has been mentioned is proved by the speech of :Allah

The Fire, to which they shall be exposed morning and evening, and on the Day when the Hour is come*: "Admit the people of Pharaoh into the most terrible chastisement!" .([۴۰:۴۶](۱)

Thus, He, the Exalted, tells that a believer, after his death as he is admitted to paradise, says: "Ah! Would that my people had knowledge that . . ." Also, He relates that an unbeliever is admitted to chastisement after his death and that he is tortured .morning and evening until the Day of Resurrection he will be made to abide in Hell

As for him who falls into oblivion (man yulha 'anhu), his spirit will be destroyed after the decomposition of his body; thus, he will be aware of nothing till the Day of Resurrection. This is the state of those who are neither purely faithful nor purely :wicked. Allah Almighty speaks of their state and says

He of them who was fairest in

.Not found in N * *-۱

.[the way will say: "You have tarried only a day" [۲۰:۱۰۴

Thus, He demonstrates that a certain group of people on the Day of Resurrection will not remember how long they were in the tombs, so that some will assume that they were in them ten days, and some will suppose a day only. This, of course, cannot be the state of those who have been tortured or blessed until the Day of Resurrection, since he who has enjoyed perpetual pleasure or punishment will not forget the .treatment he experienced, not will he be uncertain about it in his life after death

It was related from Abu'Abdillah, peace be upon him, that he said: "Only those who are purely faithful or purely unbelievers will be questioned in the grave, whereas the others will fall into oblivion." He said con- cerning the second coming (ar-raj'ah): "Those who will return at the coming of the Qaim (the Holder), peace be upon him, will be only those who are purely faithful or purely unbelievers; as for the others, there ".will be no return until the Day of Resurrection

Also, our companions are of different opinions concerning the question of what is the subject of bliss or punishment. Some are of the opinion that the subject of the eternal bliss or punishment is the spirit to which are addressed the commandments, prohibitions and legal obligations, and they call it a 'substance' (jawhar), others say that spirit is the same life which enters a body which is the

.replica of that of its lifetime on earth

Both suggestions are, in fact, conceivable by reason, but the more likely, to my mind, is the one which defines the spirit as 'the substance which Allah commands' (al-jawharu 'l-mukhatab), and this is what the philosophers name 'the simple' (al-basit). It has been related in the traditions that the prophets, peace be upon them, in particular, and the Imams, peace be upon them, after them will be translated to the heavens both body and spirit, where they will enjoy the Divine bliss in their earthly .bodies which they inhabited in the lifetime

But this is a privilege restricted to the Proofs of Allah (Hujaj Allah) only. Also, it is related from the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny, that: "He who prays for me by my tomb I will hear him, and he who prays for me from a remote place, his prayer will reach me." He, peace be upon him and his progeny, said: "He who prays for me once, I will pray for him ten times, and he who prays for me ten times I will pray for him a hundred times, then let your prayers for me be many or few." Thus he, peace be upon him and his progeny, made it clear that after he had left the world he would hear the prayer devoted to him, a fact which implies that he is .alive with Allah, the Almighty

.The state of the Imams (lit

the Righteous Guides) is the same as those who hear the prayers of a Muslim close at hand or receive his prayer if far away. This is affirmed by sound narrations related on :authority. Allah Almighty says

.[Account not those who were slain in Allah's way as dead, nay they are alive [٣:١۶٩

It has been related from the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny, that he stood by the pit of Badr and addressed the unbelievers' corpses, who were slain and thrown into a pit: "You were an evil kinsfolk to the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him and his progeny), you drove him out of his home and chased him away; then you flocked to fight against him. I have found that what my Lord promised me is true; (have you found that what your lord promised you is true?"(١)

Umar exclaimed, "O Messenger of Allah! What wis- dom is there in addressing' mouldering corpses?" Thereupon he replied: "Hush, O son of al-Khattab! I swear by Allah that you do not hear me better than they do, and nothing prevents the angels ".from clothing them with iron, but my turning my face from them like this

It is related from 'Ali ibn Abi Talib, the Commander of the Believers, peace be upon him, that after the battle of Basrah(٢) terminated, he began to inspect the ranks till he came across the corpse of Ka'b ibn Sur(٣) – *(he was appointed a judge over Basrah by 'Umar ibn

---

.See Ibn Hisham, as-Sirah, Eng. transl. by Guillaume, A., p.٣٠۶ -١

Harbu 'l-Basrah, also called Harbu 'l-Jamal, because 'Aishah, the wife of the - ٢ Prophet, was mounting a camel, around which the battle was con- centrated. Harbu 'l-Jamal was the first civil war in Islam which took place between Amiru '١-Mu'minin, 'Ali ibn Abi Talib (a.s.), and Talhah ibn'Ubaydillah, az-Zubayr ibn al-'Awwam and 'Aishah. See at-Tabari, at- Tarikh, vol.١, pt.۶, p.٣٠٧٨; Ibnu '١-Athir, al-Kamil, vol.٣, p.١۶۵; .Ibn Kathir, al-Bidayah, vol.٧, p.٢٢٩; al-Maqdisi, al-Bad' wa 't-tarikh, vol.۵, p.٢١١

Ka'b ibn Sur: (It is written 'Surah' which is a mistake.) A companion,who was sent by -٣ 'Umar as a judge to Basrah. He is known to be a man of extreme piety who would

pray thoughout the night and fast the whole day; thereupon, his wife complained of him to the Caliph who ordered him to be moderate in his worship and observe his family obligations. It is reported that he was one of those who refrained from fighting in the early stages of the Battle of Camel (i'tazala 'l fitnah) and shut himself inside a cottage; later on, under the pressure of 'Aishah, he came out displaying his Qur'an in an effort to make peace between the two camps, but was shot down by a stray arrow. See Ibn Sa'd, at-Tabaqat, vol.۷, p.۶۵.[Ka'b ibn Sur was not a companion of the Holy Prophet, and he had not heard anything from the Holy Prophet or met him. He was only a tabi'i. See Ibn 'Abdi '۱-Barr, al-Isti'ab, vol.۳, pp.۱۳۱۸-۹; Ibnu 'l-Athir, Usdu 'l-ghabah, vol.۴, pp.۲۴۲-۳; Ibn Hajar, al-Isabah, vol.۳, pp.۳۱۴-۵. Ibn Sa'd mentions him as a tabi'i from Basrah who was the companion of 'Umar ibn al-Khattab (ed.)]

al-Khattab and continued to hold office throughout the reigns of ‘Umar and ‘Uthman [ibn ‘Affan]; when the civil war broke out at Basrah, he hung the Qur’an round his neck and incited all his family to fight the Commander of the Believers and they were all .(slain)* (١)

The Commander of the Believers asked that the corpse be raised by the help of two men. Then he addressed the body and said: "، Ka‘b ibn Sur! I have found that what my Lord promised me is true. Did you find that what your lord promised you was true?" Then he asked that the body be laid aside and went on a little; then he came across the slain body of Talhah ibn ‘Ubaydillah, and asked that the body be raised, then addressed it and said: "OTalhah! I have found that what my Lord promised me is true. "?Did you find that what your lord promised you was true

Then he ordered the body to be laid aside. A man exclaimed: "O Commander of the Believers! What was the wisdom of talking to two slain bodies who were unable to follow you?" Thereupon he said: "By Allah, O men! They heard me as the people of the pit (qalib) heard the speech of the Messenger of Allah." Thus, this is one of the narrations which affirm that some of those who die will have their spirits restored to them to enjoy bliss or suffer punishment of the grave; yet this is only

---

.Not found in N * * -١

.an exception and not a general rule which applies to all the dead

What Ash–Shaykh Abu Ja'far has described about Death .۲۱

Abu Ja'far says: "The Chapter of Death: the Commander of the Believers was asked . . ."ash-Shaykh Abu 'Abdillah says: "The chapter is entitled 'Death', yet he deals with something else, whereas it was for him to deal with the reality of death or to entitle the chapter 'On the results of death and how the dead shall fare finally.' "Death is the opposite of life, nullifying growth and makingsensation impossible; also it corrupts .and obliterates it

It is the result of the direct act of Allah, the Almighty; and no one has a hand in it or :power over it, save Allah, the Almighty. Allah the Almighty, says

.[It is He Who gives life and cause to die [۴۰:۶۸

:Hence, He appropriates animation and killing to Himself. Also He, the Exalted, says

Who created death and life, that He might try you; which of you is fairest in works .[[۶۷:۲

Life is that which has growth and sensation, and endows the one in possession of it with capacity and knowledge, whereas death is that in conjunction with which growth and sensation are impossible and which deprives the dead of both ability and knowledge. Allah, the Almighty, deals death to His creatures in order to transfer them from the abode of action and trial to that of reward and retribution. Also, He makes none of them die save him for whom He knows that death is better than

his continued life, and preserves life only in those for whom He knows that life is better than death.

However, what He deals with His creatures is, in truth, intrinsically good and most beneficial for them. He might put to trial most of His creatures by the severe pangs of death, or He might exempt them from that trial. Moreover, these pangs which precede death might stand as a punishment to those afflicted by them, or it might be that they serve to purify him or others (who are afflicted by them), yet a great advantage might follow from them and a full compensation.

Also, not everyone who suffers severe pangs, before the passing of his soul, suffers them as punishment, nor is everyone who relinquishes his life easily favored and rewarded thereby; also it has been related that the pangs which precede death serve as atonement for believers for their sins, or as a punishment for the unbelievers; also the ease which precedes death is either to seduce the infidels or to serve as reward for the faithful.

Altogether, this is a question whose solution has been concealed to human intelligence; and Allah, the Almighty, has disclosed nothing of it to His creatures, in order to stir them to discriminate between the state of trial and that of punishment, and the state of reward and that of seduction, or in order to increase the severity of the trial to its utmost extent, to accomplish the purpose divinely ordained for creation.

As

for what Abu Ja'far mentioned concerning the state which the dead occupy after their death – indeed detailed reports have been handed down concerning it – and what he mentioned was only some of it, which he erroneously listed in this chapter which is of different content. In any event, death is one of the greatest joys which confronts the faithful, since it marks the beginning of his way to the abode of favor, and by the means of which he achieves the reward of the good deeds of his lifetime; whereas, for the infidel it is the first calamity he is confronted with, and the beginning of his way to punishment, since Allah, the Al-mighty, postponed the retribution of his deeds until after his death by the means of which he is transformed from the abode of obligation .to that of retribution

Indeed, the position of the believer, after his death, is more excellent than that before it, whereas the position of the infidel after his death is worse than that before it. This is so, because the believer is going to achieve his reward and the unbeliever is going .to receive his punishment

It has been related from the Family (al) of Muhammad, peace be upon him and his progeny, that "The world is the prison of the believer, the tomb his house, and paradise his abiding place, whereas the world is the paradise of the infidel, the tomb his prison, and hell his abiding place." It is also related

from them, peace be upon them, that they said: "Eternal bliss is after death and ".eternal affliction is after death

Yet we should be content with what the Qur'an states concerning the final outcome, irrespective of what the narrations say; and what is approved by reason, irrespective of the traditions, since Allah, the Almighty, has plainly stated the reward of the righteous and He has also mentioned the reward of the evil-doers, and enlarged on it; .then what He, the Exalted, stated is sufficient without need of anything else

The Belief concerning the questioning in the Grave .۲۲

Abu Ja'far says: "Our belief concerning the questioning in the grave is that it is* true."*(۱)Abu 'Abdillah ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, adds that what is mentioned by Abu Ja'far does not tell all that should be told about the questioning and its purpose; what should be mentioned in this respect is what I am .going to establish by the will of Allah, the Exalted

The genuine narrations which have been handed down from the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny are to the effect that the angels will descend to men in the grave and question them regarding their faith. It is noteworthy that the different .reports have a common tone

One of these runs thus: After death two angels of Allah, the Sublime, named Munkar and Nakir, come to the dead man and question him regarding his Lord, his Prophet his faith and his Imam; if he answers according to the truth, they deliver him

---

.Not found in N * * -۱

.to the angels of bliss, and if he falters, they deliver him to the angels of punishment

Yet, some other reports name the two angels – who come to the unbeliever – Munkar and Nakir, whereas those who come to the believer are called Mubashshir and Bashir. It has been related that the two angels sent to the unbeliever are named thus, .because he denies the truth, rejects and scorns what they bring him

The two angels sent to the believer are named Mubashshir and Bashir because they bring him glad tidings and eternal reward from the Almighty Allah. Moreover, these two names are not their personal names, but designate their acts. These, however, are reports close to each other in content, and of which the meaning is easily .conceivable, yet Allah, the Exalted, knows best the truth of it

We have also mentioned above that the only people whom the two angels will question are those who are purely faithful or completely infidels, whereas all others will fall into oblivion. This is confirmed by the traditions handed down on this matter, .and this is why we mentioned the above statement about it

Chapter: (In point of fact) the two angels will question only him who is alive and him who can understand the content of the question, and is capable of conceiving its meaning. This is clear evidence that Allah, the Almighty, will quicken the dead servant for questioning, and thereafter his life may be perpetuated for eternal grace, if he

deserves grace, or for ever-lasting punishment, if he deserves this; let us seek refuge .in Allah from His wrath, and let us beg His help to perform what He pleases

The purpose for which the two angels descend and question the servant is that Allah, the Almighty, will entrust the servant, after his death, to the angels of grace or punishment; they cannot discern what the servant is except as Allah has instructed them. And of the two angels, who come to the servant, one is from the angels of grace .and the other is from the angels of punishment

When they descend to him, they will discern his state by questioning him. Thus, if his answers are satisfactory and deserving of Divine Grace, charge of him will devolve upon the angel of grace, whereas the angel of punishment will abandon him. And if he shows signs of deserving punishment, then he will be in the care of the angel of .torment, whereas the angel of grace will abandon him

Also, it has been related that the angels appointed for reward and punishment are other than those who are appointed for questioning, and that the two angels of grace and punishment will be informed of what the servant deserves by the two angels of questioning, who have the task of questioning the servant and ascertaining what he deserves; they relate this to the angels of retribution and then they ascend to their post in heaven. These narrations are all permissible, yet

we do not prefer one to another; since they are of similar import, and since our .procedure, in such cases, is to be cautious and non-committal

Chapter: The purpose for which Allah, the Sublime, entrusts these tasks to the angels of questioning and the angels of punishment and grace, is that they worship Him through this, as is the case with the angels who show their worship through keeping record of the acts of mankind, inscribing, abrogating them and lifting the record (to Allah), and as is the case with those who serve Allah by preserving humanity from harm, or those who are commissioned to destroy the nations, or those who bear the Throne, or those who circumambulate the Ever-prosperous House (al-Baytu '۱-Ma‘mur), or those who glorify Him or those who are charged with asking forgiveness for the faithful, or those who are employed in showing grace to the people of .Paradise, or those who are assigned to torture the people of Hell

Thus, all worship Him to gain His grace and they do not serve Him in vain(۱); as men and jinn do not serve Him for play. But all worship Him, looking to His reward, or that He should make Him- self known to them, or to show their thanks to Him, Who favored them with His favors. For Allah is able to punish him who deserves it, or to shower His grace upon him who merits it without mediators, for the reasons given above, and for the Divine

---

۱- T, wa ta‘abbuduhum bidhalika liyuthibahum ‘alayha – N, wa 't-ta‘abbudu bidhalika liyuthibahum ‘ala 'l-a‘mali 'l-lati yuadduna biha 't-taklif kamata‘abbada 'l-bashar wa 'l-jinn bi 'l-a‘mal liyuthibahum ‘alayha . . .

.wisdom as has been shown

The position of the two angels who will come and question the dead after their departure from this world is a theme attested by textual proof (as-sam‘), whereas the question of Allah quickening the dead at the time of questioning is a theme proved by reason, since questioning the dead or inquiring of an inanimate body is inconceivable, because speech is only valid with a rational being, capable of understanding speech, and approving it, and thereby bearing the responsibility for what was within his .power

Yet it has been related that to everyone subject to questioning, life will be restored after death,that he may be capable of understanding what is addressed to him; thus the reports which are related confirm what has been proved by reason. And even if .we lack traditions, then the proof of reason is, indeed, sufficient in this respect

What Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja‘far has mentioned about Divine Justice .۲۳

Abu Ja‘far says: "The chapter concerning Divine Justice . . ."Abu ‘Abdillah ash-Shaykh al-Mufid adds: "Justice is the recompense of an action as it deserves, and injustice is the prevention of what is due." Allah, the Most High, is the Generous, the Ever-giving, the All-gracious, the Compas- sionate, Who assures the reward for acts and fair indemnity for undeserved sufferings. Moreover, He has promised to bestow His grace :in abundance and says

.[For those who do good the reward is most fair and abundant [۱۰:۲۶

Thus, He states that the righteous will be requited with the reward they deserve and .with His bounty

And

:He says

He to whom a good deed is accredited shall be recompensed ten-fold; which states that he would be endowed with ten-fold of what he deserves, and – He to whom an evil-deed is accredited shall only be recompensed as it deserves and they shall not be – [wronged [۶:۱۶۰

which implies that he shall only be recompensed with the minimum of what he justly deserves. Also, He assures men of His pardon and promises to them His forgiveness, :and He, the Exalted, says

.[Thy Lord is forgiving to men, for all their evil-doing [۱۳:۶

:And He, the Exalted, says

Surely, Allah will not forgive that a partner should be ascribed to Him; less than that .[He forgives to whomsoever He will [۴:۴۸

:And He, the Exalted says

.[In the bounty of Allah and His mercy, in that let them rejoice [۱۰:۵۸

Yet, what right the servant might possess is that to which Allah, the Sublime, has entitled him and is what is dictated by His generosity and bounteousness. Since, if He requited him in accordance with justice, he could never lay claim by right to all that with which Allah has endowed him. Since, also, Allah first showed His creation His favours, thereby obliging them to show their gratitude to Him, yet no one of His creatures is able to make an adequate return for the favours which He has showered upon him through his good acts, nor can anyone give thanks to Him without falling short of the

.gratitude worthy of the favour

Moreover, the People of the Qiblah (i.e., the Muslim community as a whole) unanimously agreed to stigmatize as an evil-doer him who claims that he has fulfilled all the obligations Allah has imposed upon him, and that he has given good measure in return for the favours with which Allah has endowed him. Also, they agreed unanimously that, however, thankful they were to Allah, they fell short of a worthy gratitude; and that even if their terms should be prolonged to the end of time, they .would never fulfil their debts perfectly to Allah, the Exalted

Thus, the foregoing argument indicates that what He entitled them to claim as a deserved right is so, only because of His generosity, bounty and graciousness. In fact, rationally, there is a different between a thankful worker and one who does not work, and since the precedence and superiority of the worker are recognized over the idle man, then it must rationally be inferred that his praise is, in fact, considered due to him, and it must further be inferred that he is privileged above the idle man, for it would be only just that Allah should require him with what is his due according to reason. Above all, Allah, the Almighty, commands justice and forbids wrong, and says: ,Surely

.[Allah commands justice and the doing of good [۱۶:۹۰

Chapter on Al-A'raf .۲۴

Abu Ja'far says: "Our belief concerning al-A'raf is that it is a dividing wall . . ."ash-:Shaykh al-Mufid comments that

It has been said that al-A'raf is a mountain midway between Paradise and the Fire." Also, that it is a dividing wall between Paradise and Hell. It is generally considered a (particular) place belonging neither to Paradise nor to Hell."These interpretations are confirmed by traditions, which furthermore, state that on the Day of Resurrection there will be found upon it the Messenger of Allah, the Commander of the Believers and the Imams from his progeny – may the blessing of Allah be upon him and his .family

:Those are they whom Allah, the Exalted, and means by His saying

And on the ramparts do men know each by their mark, who shall call to the inhabitants of Paradise: "Peace be upon you! They have not entered it, for all their ,[eagerness" [۷:۴۶

that is, because Allah, the Almighty, will enable them to discriminate between the .inhabitants of Paradise and those of Hell by signs resembling marks

:This He illustrates further in His saying

They know each by their mark". And also: The sinners shall be known by their marks" .[[۵۵:۴۱

:He the Almighty, also says

Surely in that are signs for such as mark; surely they are on a way still un- effaced .[[۱۵:۷۵-۷۶

Thus, He tells that amongst His creatures there is a group which scrutinizes men and knows them by the marks they bear. It has been related from the Commander of the Believers, peace be upon him, that he has said in some of his narrations, "I am the holder

of the baton and the clear-sighted", which means that he knows the state of him .whom he scrutinizes carefully

It has been related from Abu Ja'far Muhammad al- Baqir, peace be upon him, that he was questioned on the meaning of the speech of Allah: "Surely in that are signs for such as mark(١) , he said, "That it refers to us, the People of the House (i.e., the Imams, peace be upon them)." It is also mentioned in the traditions that Allah, the Almighty will place therein, that is, al-A'raf, a group of men who have failed to merit Paradise by their good acts and have not deserved punishment, yet they do not merit an eternal abode in Hell; among these are they who wait for the decision of Allah and entertain hope of intercession; they will abide there till they are permitted to enter Paradise through the intercession of the Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny, .and the Commander of the Believers and the Imams, peace be upon them

It has been mentioned also that it is an abode of those who were not subject to any relig- ious obligation in their lifetime, thus they do not deserve either Paradise or Hell; therefore Allah will place them therein and recompense them with a certain grace which is far below that of those who merited it by the virtue of their acts. Hence, all that is mentioned above (concerning al-A'raf) is tenable by reason and confirmed by traditions, and

---

.See al-Kulayni, al-Kafi, vol.l, p.٢١٨, Tradition nos.l ٢. Also, al-Mufid,al-Ikhtisas, p.٣٠٣ -١

yet Allah best knows the truth. What is generally accepted regarding al-A'raf is that it is a place midway between Paradise and Hell; there will stand those whom we call the Proofs of Allah to His creatures (Hujaj Allah, that is, the Prophet and the Imams); there, also, will be those whose final judgment has been deferred. Beyond this Allah knows best what will be.

25. The Belief concerning the Bridge (As-Sirat)

* Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far says: "Our belief concerning as- Sirat is that it is true, and that it is a bridge"*(1).ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: "as-Sirat, linguistically means 'way' (at-tariq), hence religion is called 'the way', since it is the way to the right (path).

That is why accepting the mastership of the Commander of the Believers and the Imams of his progeny is called 'a way'. Similar to this is the saying of the Commander of the Believers, "I am the straight path of Allah, and the most firm cord which is unbreakable", by which he meant that knowing him and adhering to him is the way to Allah, the Exalted.

It has been related that the way to Paradise on the Day of Resurrection is like a bridge over which people pass, and that is the bridge on the right side of which the Messenger of Allah, peace be upon him and his progeny, will stand and the Commander of the Believers, peace be upon him, on the left side, where they will receive the call from Allah, the Sublime,

"Cast, you twain, into Hell

۱- * * Not found in N.

.[every froward unbeliever" [۵۰:۲۴

It is also related that no one will be permitted to cross the bridge except those who hold with them a writ of immunity from the Fire (bara'ah), given by ‘Ali ibn Abi Talib, .peace be upon him

It is also related that the bridge is finer than a hair and sharper than a sword to the unbeliever – that is to say, the foot of the unbeliever will never stand firmly on it on the Day of Resurrection because of the dread and fear of that Day with which they will be confronted. Then they will walk on it as one who walks on a thing finer than a hair and sharper than a sword. Yet this is only an expression to illustrate the dread which afflicts the unbeliever when he crosses the bridge. It is a way either to Paradise or to Hell, and from which the servant may look out on Paradise or see the terrors of .Hell

:As-Sirat might also signify a tortuous path, and this is why Allah, the Almighty, says

.[And this, My path, is straight" [۶:۱۵۳"

Thus He distinguished His path which is the true religion, and which He ordered to be followed from those which lead astray. Also, the Almighty, in commanding His servants to pray and recite the Qur’an says: Guide us in the straight path [l:۵], which indicates that the other paths are not straight and that the path of the Almighty Allah is His religion, whereas

the path of Satan is the path of rebelliousness. Thus, as-Sirat, as we dem- onstrated above, originally means path, as as-Sirat of the Day of Resurrection is the path which .has to be followed either to Paradise or to Hell

Chapter concerning Al–'Aqabat .۲۶

ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: "Our belief concerning this is that verily these mountain- passes (al-'aqabat) have each a specific name; some are called fard (compulsory duty) others, amr (command); yet others, nahy ".((prohibition

ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: "al-'Aqabat desinates the obliga- tory acts, the inquiry into their performance and the confronta- tion with them on the Day of Judgment. It does not mean mountains which exist on earth and which have to be ascended. They are acts which are likened to al-'aqabat for the reason that, just as a man finds it hard and exhausting to climb a mountainpass ('aqabah), so also does he find the efforts .which he makes to avoid shortcomings in his obedience to Allah, the Sublime

:Allah, the Almighty, says

Yet he has not assaulted the steep, and what shall teach what is the steep, the freeing .[of a slave [۹۰:۱۱-۱۳

Thus He, the Exalted, names the acts which He has made compulsory for His servants "'aqabat ', likening them to steep roads and mountains because of the hardship a man suffers in order to perform them as if he were ascending a mountain road, difficult of .access

The Commander of the Believers, peace be upon him, says: "In front of you

lie difficult passes and dreadful stages through which one must pass and halt there; then you would either, by the grace of Allah, be saved, or you would suffer irrevocable destruction". He meant by ‘aqabah, to get rid of responsibilities and obligations .(imposed upon men (by Allah

Hence, this is far from what the Hashwiyyah maintain, that on the last day there will be mountains and steep roads which men must cross, either walking or riding; and this is nonsense if compared with the Divine purpose of retribution. Also, it is needless to create difficult passes to designate by each or poor-tax, or fasting, or pilgrimage or other obligatory acts which are to be ascended by men, so that if he falls short in his .obedience to Allah, this would prevent him from ascending them

The purpose of the Day of Judgment is to inquire into men's acts, and retribution for them either by reward or punishment, a fact which does not require the naming of passes or creating mountains to be crossed with ease or difficulty. Moreover, no tradition has been handed down which supports such an allegation, or from which we can derive such an interpretation. Then as we have no support in traditions in this .respect, the sound interpretation is the one put forward above

(The belief concerning reckoning and balance (Al-Hisab wa 'l-Mizan .۲۷

ash-Shaykh Abu Ja‘far Reckoning is that it is true".says:*(۱), "Our belief concerning* ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, adds that: Reckoning is the ,balancing of actions and the requital

---

.Not found in N * * -۱

the examination of the servant on what he has done inadver- tently, and recompensing him for his evil actions and praising him for good actions; and treating .him in accordance with what he deserves

It cannot mean what the Orthodox (lit. the common folk – al-'Ammah) maintain; that it is the setting of good actions against the base ones, and striking a balance between them in accordance with what reward or punishment each deserves, since tahahut(۱) (the mutual cancellation of good and evil deeds) is absurd; and the doctrine of the Mu'tazilah in this respect is invalid and unconfirmed. Claim as to its meaning are .irrational

Also, the Hashwiyyahal-Mawazin is the equating, "ta'dil", of the reward to its due place, and to ensure that each one receives what is his due. Then it is self-evident that the meaning of this is far from what the Hashwiyyah maintain, that on the Day of Resurrection there will be scales like the scales of this world, each with two pans into which works will be put, since actions are accidents, and accidents cannot be measured exactly, but can only be described as heavy or light, metaphorically, which means that the heavy is what is abundant and deserves a high reward, and the light is .what is of little worth and does not deserve a good reward

The traditions which relate that the Commander of the Believers and the Imams of his progeny, peace be upon them, are the scales, signify that they are the ones

---

۱- For the meaning of tahabut, see Ibn Manzur, Lisanu 'l-'Arab, vol.۶, p.۲۷۰ ;ar-Razi, at-Tafsir, vol.۲, p.۲۲۰; al-Jurjani, Sharhu 'l-mawaqif, vol.۲, p.۴۸۸.

who will evaluate (men's) works and their due, and that they are the ones who will give judgment on them in justice and right. We say, "so-and-so for me is the worth (fi mizan) of so-and-so", which means that he is equal to him. And we say, "the speech of so-and-so is (awzan) than the speech of so-and-so", which means it is more excellent and held in greater esteem.

What Allah, the Sublime, says on Reckoning and the fear resulting from it, is that it is a man's confrontation with, and questioning on, his deeds, since he who is confronted with what he has done cannot escape from the consequences, and he whom Allah, the Sublime, pardons will attain salvation.

Then he, whose scales are heavy (with the great worth of his reward), they are the prosperous, and he whose scales are light, (because his acts of obedience were few), they have lost their souls, abiding for ever in Hell [۲۳:۱۰۲-۳].

Moreover, the Qur'an has been revealed in the language of the Arabs, whether in the real sense of the words, or in their metaphorical meaning, and has not been revealed in the vulgar tongue (and cannot be interpreted) according to the limited perception of vain minds.

۲۸. Concerning Paradise and Hell (Al –Jannah wa 'N–nar)

Abu Ja'far says: "Our belief concerning Paradise is that it is the abode of eternity* (daru 'l-baqa')*(۱).ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, comments: Paradise is the abode of grace where weariness shall not touch its inmates, nor fatigue distress them; Allah, the

---

۱- * * Not found in N.

Exalted, set it up for those who knew and worshipped Him. Its grace is perpetual and shall never cease. The dwellers therein are of different ranks.

Those who were perfectly devoted to Allah, the Almighty, they will enter immune from the punishment of Allah. And those who mingled good actions with base ones, and put off repentance continually, death shall cut them off before they achieve it, and then certain punishment will overtake them in their lifetime or after, or in this life alone; then they will dwell in Paradise after being forgiven by Allah or punished.

And among them there would be those who will receive the grace of Allah by no previous action of their own in [this] world, these are the immortal youths (al-wildanu 'l- mukhalladun) whom Allah, the Sublime, appointed for the service of the dwellers in Paradise to requite them for their good actions. They suffer neither hardship nor trouble in their service, since they are designed by nature to perform the demands of the believers.

The reward of the dwellers in Paradise is to enjoy the delights of eating, drinking, pleasant scenes and marriage, and every pleasure of the senses to which their natural inclination leads them with which they will achieve their desires. Hence, in Paradise there is no human being who enjoys pleasure without eating, drinking, or gratification of the senses. The claim of him who alleges that in Paradise there are some who find pleasure in exalting and glorifying Allah without

.enjoying food or drink is, in fact, foreign to the religion of Islam

It is an imitation of the Christians who allege that those who obey God in their lifetime will be transformed into angels who neither drink, nor eat, nor are married. Allah, the Exalted, declares this assertion a lie in His Book, when He promises to those who do :good eating, drinking, and marriage, and the Almighty says

.[Its produce is eternal, and its shade. That is, the requital of the godfearing [۱۳:۳۵

:And He, the Almighty, says

.[Therein are rivers of sweet water [۴۷:۱۵

:And He, the Exalted, says

.[Houris, cloistered in pavilions [۵۵:۷۲

:And He, the Sublime, says

.[And wide-eyed houris [۵۶:۲۲

:And He, the Exalted, says

.[And We shall espouse them to wide-eyed houris [۴۴:۵۴

:And He, the Almighty, says

.[And with the maidens of equal age restraining their glances [۳۸:۵۲

:And He, the Sublime, says

Verily, the inmates of Paradise shall on that day be busy rejoicing, they and their .[spouses [۳۶:۵۵-۵۶

. . . :And He, the Exalted says

that they shall be given in perfect semblance; and there for them shall be spouses .[purified; therein they shall dwell forever [۲:۲۵

How, then, do some hold it permissible to maintain that in Paradise there is a group of human beings who do not eat or drink, and that they take delight in what is an affliction to (the rest of) humanity, whereas the Book of Allah disclaims this; and the consensus of opinion is against it,

whether it is in imitation of some whom it is relying on spurious traditions .not permissible to imitate, or As for Hell, it is the abode of those who have not known .Allah, the Exalted

Some of those who acknowledge Allah may enter Hell because of their disobedience; but they will not abide therein eternally; rather, they will come out and enter perpetual grace, since none but the polytheists will reside therein forever. Allah, the :Sublime, says

Now I have warned you of a Fire that flames, to which none but the most wretched .[shall be exposed [۹۲:۱۴-۱۵

Here, 'shall be exposed to the Fire' means 'the eternal abiding therein'. Allah, the :Sublime says

.[Surely those who disbelieve Our signs, We shall certainly expose them to a Fire [۴:۵۶

:And He, the Almighty, says

Verily, those who disbelieve even if they had what is in the earth, all of it with it, that they might ransom themselves with it from the punishment of the Day of .[Resurrection, it shall not be accepted from them . . . [۵:۳۶

Thus, every verse which implies the meaning of eternal abiding in the Fire, concerns only the polytheists rather than those who acknowledge the existence of Allah, the Almighty, according to the proofs of reason, and as supported (by the use) of the Book and the accepted traditions and the consensus of opinion, and the precedent current .(before the innovators amongst the followers of the doctrine of "threat"(۱

The Point of Unbelief .۲۹

The Point of Unbelief (Haddu’t

۱- This is one of the five principal tenets of the Mu‘tazilah. See al-Khayyat,al Intisar,

.p.۱۲۶; al-Ash'ari, op. cit., vol.I, p.۲۷۸

(Takfir) (۱)-

Thus, it is not possible to maintain that he who is an unbe- liever can know Allah, or that he who believes in Him can be ignorant of Him. According to our principles, he who is an infidel is also ignorant of Allah. Consequently, he who, though he be among the community of Islam, deviates from the principles of the faith, is, in our opinion, ignorant of Allah, the Exalted, even if he professes the Unity of Allah.

As is also the case with those who do not believe in the Messenger of Allah, even though there are amongst them some who profess the Unity of Allah and behave in a fashion which might delude the weak into (believing) that they know Allah. Allah, the Almighty, says:

And whosoever believes in his Lord, he shall fear neither loss nor wrong [۷۲:۱۳];

thereby He excludes the believers from the decrees binding on the infidels. Also, Allah, the Almighty, says:

But no, by thy Lord! They will not believe till they make thee the judge regarding the disagreement between them [۴:۶۵].

Thus, He denied faith to those who believe not in the Messenger of Allah and because of their reservation in this matter, their knowledge of Allah cannot be accepted. He, the Almighty, the Exalted, says:

Fight those who believe not in Allah and the Last Day . . . and they are in a state of subjection [۹:۲۹],

Whereby He denied faith to the Jews and the Christians, and relegated them to

---

۱ - Hadd: Literally means to restrain from, al-man'. In jurisprudence it means the restrictive ordinances of the religious law of Islam. See al-Jurjani, at-Ta'rifat, p.۵۷; Ibn Manzur, op. cit., vol.۳, p.۱۴۲.

.unbelief and error

(Concerning the descent of revelation (Nuzulu 'l–Wahy .۳۰

Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says *on the descent of revelation that*(۱) , "Our belief concerning this is that there is a Tablet between the two eyes of Israfil . . ." ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, says that Abu Ja‘far depends in this matter on a shadhdh tradition which is not generally accepted. Moreover, he has mentioned previously that the Tablet is an angel of Allah, .the Almighty

Wahy, originally, means a hushed speech; it might also bear the meaning of any speech which is intended to be understood by the hearer privately and by no one else, and directed at him and to no one else. But if it is applied to Allah, the Sublime, then according to the usage of Islam and the law of the Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny, it signifies what has been reserved for the messengers, peace be upon .them, alone and is not given to others

:Allah, the Sublime, says

;[So We revealed to Moses's mother, "Suckle him . . ." [۲۸:۷

thereupon Muslims unanimously agreed that the revelation in this case was a vision, or a speech addressed to and heard by Moses's mother alone, when she was asleep. :And Allah, the Sublime, says

,[And thy Lord revealed unto the bees [۱۶:۶۸

which means a secret illumination, since it is restricted to the bees, and the bees are acquainted with it without a speech proclaimed loudly by the

---

.Not found in N * *–۱

:speaker in order to be heard by others. And Allah, the Sublime, says

,[Surely the devils inspire their friends [۶:۱۲۱

which means that they whisper to their friends through what they introduce into their inmost hearing, by which means they inform privately without telling it abroad. And :He, the Exalted, says

,[He came forth unto his people from the sanctuary and inspired them [۱۹:۱۱

which means that he commanded them without the utterance of words. He likened this (i.e., his signal to them) to revelation in being hidden from others and secret from .them

Allah, the Exalted, (might give illumination to many of His creatures in their dreams, the interpretation of which may be proved sound and their truth established, yet they cannot be specified as revelation, since the shari'ah has been settled once and for all. Also, it is not permissible to say of those who are inspired with the knowledge of .something that Allah has revealed it to them

Also (according to our tenets) Allah, the Almighty might inspire the proofs after His Prophet, peace be upon him and his progeny, with speech which descends to them, revealing what will be, but still it cannot be called revelation for the reasons given above, which confirms that the general consensus of the learned Muslims is that no revelation can descend on anyone after our Prophet, may Allah bless him and his progeny and grant him salvation. Therefore, none of these things which we mentioned can be called a revelation

to anyone, since it is for Allah, the Exalted, to permit the use of the term at one time and forbid it at another, sometimes to prohibit it and to allow it to others. As for its .significance, it never departs from its true meaning as given above

Chapter: As for the revelation from Allah, the Most High, to His Messenger, may Allah bless him and his progeny, it was conveyed to him, sometimes without an intermediary, and some- times from the lips of the angels who transmitted it to him. What Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, has mentioned concerning the Tablet and the Pen, and what he confirmed on this matter, has only one tradition .supporting it

Yet we do not rely on it, nor do we affirm its authenticity, and we testify only to that which we know, since the tradition is not mutawatir, nor is it confirmed by the consensus of opinion, nor does the Qur'an proclaim it, nor is it established by a Proof (an imam) of Allah, the Almighty, that it would be considered tenable. And the best course is to reserve judgment on it, and to allow it without affirming it or declaring it sound definitively, and keep it within the bounds of possibility. As for the certainty with which Abu Ja'far affirms it and his belief in it, this is nothing but blind imitation, and far .be it from us to imitate (anything) blindly

(On the Revelation of the Qur'an (Nuzulu 'l-Qur'an .۳۱

Ash-Shaykh Abu Ja'far, may Allah have

mercy upon him, says that: "The Qur’an was sent down in one lot, in the month of Ramadan, on the Night of Power (laylatu 'l-qadr), (first) to al-Baytu 'l-Ma‘mur (the ". . . ever-prosperous house). And then it was revealed in the space of twenty years

ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says that: What Abu Ja‘far, may Allah have mercy upon him, maintains in this respect, originally de- rives from an ahad tradition which is not a fit .basis, either for doctrine or for practice

Moreover, the revelation of the Qur’an piecemeal, as need arose, bears witness to the contrary, since it includes the description of what had happened and the narration of what was past, and this indeed indicates that it was only revealed as need arose. ,Do you not realize the speech of Allah, the Exalted: And for their saying

.[Our hearts are uncircumcised", nay, but Allah sealed them for their unbelief [۴:۱۵۵"

:And His saying

They say, "Had the All-merciful so willed, we would not have served them", They have .[no knowledge of that [۴۳:۲۰

This involves information about the past which requires that the narrator should not precede it, since this involves giving information about something past, which has not yet happened– indeed, is still in the future. There are many such instances in the Qur’an, one of which is the narration of zihar(۱) , and the reason for it; when a woman complained to the Prophet, may Allah bless him and his progeny, about the judgment ,on it, Allah

---

Zihar: Putting away the wife by saying: "Thou art to me as the back of my mother:" -۱ This concerned Khawlah bint Malik ibn Tha‘labah, who was divorced by her husband. Aws ibn Samit, with this form of words, currentamong the Arabs of the jahiliyyah but forbidden in Islam by this verse, The penance for it is the freeing of a slave, the feeding of sixty poor or two months successive fast. For a detailed discussion, see

Ibnu '۱-'Arabi, Ahkamu 'l-Qur'an, vol.۴, p.۱۷۳۴; al-Qasimi, Mahasinu 't-ta'wi۱, vol.۱۶, .p.۵۷۰۶

:the Exalted, revealed

.[Allah has heard the words of her that disputes with thee [۵۸:l

Now this is an incident that happened at Medina; then how can we say that Allah, the Exalted, revealed it at Mecca before the emigration took place and thus state that it happened when in fact it had not. Moreover, if we look at the accounts reported in the Qur'an, then we would come across many instances similar to that which we have mentioned, and which will take us beyond the scope of our discussion. Thus, what we have mentioned is sufficient for men of perception. In fact, the tradition resembles the doctrine of the anthropomorphist, who claim that the Qur'an is the eternal words of Allah, the Praised, the Exalted, and that it relates the future as if it were the past; their teaching has been refuted by the adherents of Allah's Unity (by the assertors of .the Unity of Allah – ahlu 't-tawhid) in the manner demonstrated above

The tradition that the Qur'an was revealed 'all of a piece' on the Night of Power, may bear another interpretation, that 'a piece of it' (jumlatun minhu) was revealed on the Night of Power, then the rest of what has been revealed until the death of the Prophet, may Allah bless him and his progeny, followed this. But that it has been revealed as a whole and altogether on the Night of Power is a notion which is far from what the plain meaning of the

Qur'an teaches, and is in contrast to the mutawatir traditions and the consensus of .the learned divines, irrespective of their different inferences

:Chapter: As for the meaning of the speech of the Almighty Allah

And hasten not (O Muhammad) with the Qur'an ere its revelation is accomplished ,[unto thee [۲۰:۱۱۴

there are two proper interpretations for it other than that mentioned by Abu Ja'far, .which he derived from a shadhdh tradition

The first is that Allah, the Exalted, forbids him (Muhammad) to be hasty in the interpretation of what has been revealed to him in accordance with the rules of the language of the Arabs, though it may be permissible, and the second is that the Prophet, may Allah bless him and his progeny, used to follow Jibril in his recitation, word by word, hence, Allah, the Exalted, commanded him not to do so, but to hearken to what was brought to him by Jibril, or to what was sent down to him without intermediary till it came to an end: and when the revelation was completed, to recite it .and give it utterance and declare it

Thus, the interpretation put forward by him who relies on the tradition (mentioned above) is far from the truth, since there is no reason to maintain that Allah, the Exalted, has com- manded him not to be hasty with the Qur'an which is in the fourth heaven until it is revealed to him wholly, since he possesses no knowledge about what there is in the fourth

.heaven before it is revealed to him

It is also meaningless to restrain him from what is beyond his powers, except if one claims that he possessed full knowledge of the Qur’an which is in the fourth heaven; then, by assuming this, his argument and position collapses, because he has maintained that the Qur’an is originally in the (fourth) heaven; and since what is in the breast of the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and his progeny, and in its .preservation on the earth, then it is absurd that it should be confined to the heavens

Moreover, if what is in the preservation (i.e., memory) of the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and his progeny, is described as being in the fourth heaven, then what is in the preservation of others should be described the same way; then it cannot be ascribed to the fourth heaven, nor, still less, to the first, in preference to the fourth. Thus, he who considers what we have said would realize that the interpretation of the .verse by him who relied on the tradition is far from the truth

(The Belief on Impeccability (Al–‘Ismah .۳۲

Abu Ja‘far says: "Chapter on the belief on al-‘ismah (impeccability)"*(۱) ash-Shaykh* al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: The impeccability granted by Allah to His Proofs is the succour and grace by which the Proofs keep themselves free from sin and error in the religion of Allah, the Exalted. The impeccability, in fact, is a grace ,granted by Allah

---

.Not found in N * * -۱

.the Exalted, to him whom He knows will hold fast by it

Hence, freedom from sin is the action of him who maintains himself free from sin, and this freedom from sin does not involve being pre- vented from committing a base act, nor does it oblige or compel him who possesses it to act righteously; rather it is a thing which Allah, the Exalted, knows that if He bestows it upon one of His slaves, no trace .of fault will be found in him

Yet, this privilege is not bestowed freely upon all men; rather it is restricted to those :who are the chosen and the best. Allah, the Exalted, says

But as for those unto whom, already, the reward most fair has gone forth from Us, .[they shall be kept far from it (Hell) [۲۱:۱۰۱

:And He, the Praised, says

.[Certainly We chose them, out of a knowledge, above all beings [۴۴:۳۲

:And He, the Exalted, says

.[And in Our sight they are, indeed, of the chosen, the excellent [۳۸:۴۷

Also, we are of the opinion) that the Prophet and the Imams after them are free from) sin during their prophethood and imamate, whether major or minor. It is arguable that they might omit a supererogatory act, yet without intending to commit disobedience thereby. It is inconceivable that they should omit an obligatory act either .before or after their imamate

Chapter: And whenever perfection is attributed to them in their different states of life, it implies their perfection in all

states in which they were Proofs of Allah to His creatures. It has been related that the Messenger of Allah, may the blessing and peace of Allah be upon him and his progeny, and the Imams from his progeny after him were entitled to be the Proofs of Allah, the .Exalted, from the time when they achieved years of discretion until Allah took them

Yet, even before they attained the age of religious responsibility, they were not subject to defects and ignorance since they were of the pattern of Jesus and John, peace be upon them, in that they were endowed with perfection though they were still children, and had not attained the age of discretion. And, in fact, this is a tenable .proposition, one which admits of rational proof

Besides that, there is no justification for declaring false the traditions in this respect: at any rate it is necessary only to maintain their perfection, peace be on them, in knowledge and impeccability during their prophet-hood and imamate, and to hold a non-committal attitude regarding their careers before that, whether it was a state of prophet-hood and imamate or not, and to affirm that impeccability is inevitable from the time Allah, the Sublime, brings them to full discretion .till He, the Almighty, makes .them (peace be upon them) die

(Chapter on Excess and Delegation (Al-Ghuluww wa't-Tafwid .۳۳

Abu Ja'far says: "Chapter concerning the denial of Excess and Delegation ".ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: 'Excess' (al-ghuluww)(۱), linguistically means 'exceeding the limit and turning aside from the true goal'. Allah, the

---

al-Ghuluww: The technical term for the ultra-Shi'ah groups. "Originally, it seems to -۱ have had", as Friedlaender observed, "a wider range and to have been applied to other than Shi'ite movements", (op. cit., p.۱۲). 'Ali burnt* several of certain groups of them who publicly proclaimed his divinity. ash-Shahristani says that the innovations of the extremists can be restricted to four: Anthropomorphism (at-tashbih, al-bada', i.e., mutability of Allah's Will), ar-raj'ah (the return) and at-tanasukh, transmigration or reincarnation, (al-Milal, vo۱.۲, p.۱۱). See also Lisanu 'l-'Arab, vol.l۵, p.۱۳۲; an-

Nawbakhti, Firaqu 'sh-Shi‘ah, p.۳۵; al-Ash‘ari, op. cit., vol.l, p.۱۶; Ibn Hazm, al-Fisal, vol.۴, p.۱۸۶; Ibnu 'l-Jawzi, Talbis Iblis, p.۹۹; at- Tahanawi, Kashshaf istilahati 'l-funun, vol.۲, p.۱۰۹۹.*[What has come to us in the Shi‘ite Traditions Amiru '۱-Mu’minin, peace be upon him, has not killed them by burning but they were suffocated by an overwhelming sour fumes. What has been narrated by the translator was quoted [.(from the Sunni sources (ed

:Almighty, says

O, People of the Book! Do not exaggerate in your religion, nor utter aught concerning .[Allah save the truth [۴:۱۷۱

Hence, He forbade exceeding the limits concerning the belief in the Messiah, and warned against turning aside from the true goal in speech, and declared the Christians' claims about him excess, since they went beyond the limit, as we have .explained

The Extremists (al-Ghulat) among those who outwardly profess Islam, are those who attribute divinity and prophethood to the Commander of the Believers and Imams of his progeny, peace be upon them, and ascribe to them privileges concerning their status in this world and the world to come, by which they go beyond the limit and turn aside from the goal; hence they are evil-doers and infidels whom the Commander of the Believers * has sentenced to death, and the stake; * (۱) also the Imams, peace be .upon them, have branded them with unbelief and departing from the pale of Islam

Chapter: As for what Abu Ja'far mentions of the death of our Prophet and the Imams by poison or murder, some of this is confirmed as fact and some not. What is confirmed is that the Commander of the Believers, al-Hasan and al-Husayn, peace be upon them, departed from this world by murder, none of them died a natural death. .Musa ibn Ja'far, peace be upon him, was killed by poison

It is highly probable that ar-Rida ('Ali ibn Musa) was poisoned, yet this cannot be confirmed. As for the

---

۱ - ۵۶ T, hakama fihim Amiru 'l Mu'minin bi 'l-qatl wa 't-tahriq bi 'n-nar. . .; N,hakama .fihim Amiru 'l-Mu'minin bi 'l-kufr

others, there is no justification for the claim that they were either poisoned or murdered or killed through persecution, since the reports concerning this matter are .extremely confused, and there are no means of proving it definitely

The adherents of the doctrine of delegation (al-Mufawwidah)(١) are a group of extremists who are distinguished from the others by their peculiar claim that though the Imams are created, originated beings, and not eternal, yet they ascribe to them creation and sustaining. Also, they maintained that Allah, the Exalted, created them and ceased to create, delegating to them the creation of the world and what lay .therein

As for the Hallajiyyah, they are a certain group of Sufis, the adherents of the doctrine of licentiousness (ibahah) and incarnation (al-hulul)(٢) . Al-Hallaj(٣) outwardly claimed to be a Shi'ah, yet he, in fact, was a Sufi. The Hallajiyyah are, indeed, heretics and zindiqs, appearing to each sect as if they were of their persuasion, and claiming impossible powers for al-Hallaj, as the fire-worshippers used to ascribe miracles to Zoroaster, and the Christians who attribute miracles and wonders to their monks. Yet, fire-worshippers and Christians are nearer to fulfilling duties than they are, and, indeed, they are further removed from the observance and practice of the law than .are the fire-worshippers and the Christians

Chapter: As for the claim of Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, that he who accuses the learned divines of Qum of attributing to the Imams less than their due, should be stigmatized

---

١- Al-Mufawwidah: A group which maintains that Allah created Muhammad, peace be upon him and his progeny, (some add 'Ali, peace be upon him),then He committed to him (or to them) the management of the world and the disposal of its affairs. Then Muhammad, peace be upon him and his progeny, entrusted the rule of the universe to 'Ali and the Imams, peace be upon them, after him. According to Friedlaender, "At the bottom of this idea lies the Gnostic discrimination between the 'unoriginated,

inconceiv- able Father' and the word (Logos) emanating from him which is Demiurge", op. cit., p.۹۲; see also al-Baghdadi, al-Firaq, p.۲۳۷; al-Ash'ari, op. cit., p.۱۶; Ibnu '۱-Jawzi, op. cit., p.۹۸; Ibn Hazm, op. cit., vol.۴, p.۱۷۹.

۲- al-Hululiyyah: A group who derive their name from the doctrine of incarnation, hulul, and incorporation, imtizaj. They held that it is possible and permissible for Allah to become incarnated in man's body. Most of them have, also, an inclination to a relaxed attitude towards religious obligations prescribed by the Divine Law. The Hululis are often mentioned as followers of and related to al-Hallaj; nevertheless, al-Hujwiri denies this relation and says that, "In the compositions of al-Hallaj himself there is nothing but profound theosophy" (al-Hujwiri, Kashfu 'l-mahjub, Eng. transl. by Prof. Nicholson, R.A., p.۲۶۰). See al-Baghdadi, op. cit., p.۲۴۱; al-Ash'ari, op. cit., pp.۱۳-۱۴; Ibnu '۱-Jawzi, op. cit., p.۱۷۱ ; Friedlaender, L, op. cit., vol.۲, p.۱۲; at-Tahanawi, op. cit., vol.۱, p.۳۵۲.

۳- Abu '۱-Mughith al-Husayn ibn Mansur ibn Mahama al-Baydawi: APersian mystic and theologian. His grandfather is said to have been a magician. He was born in ۲۴۴/۸۵۸ at at-Tur near al-Bayda (Fars). He was accused of being charlatan by the Mu'tazilah, ex-communicated by a tawqi' of the Imamiyyah and a fatwa of the Zahiriyyah, and twice arrested by the 'Abbasid police (E.I., the article, "al-Hallaj", by Massignon, L.). "The Sufi shaykhs", says al-Hujwiri, "are at variance concerning him. Some reject him, while others accept him. Others suspended their judgment about him" (op. cit., p.۱۵۰). He was executed by crucifixion after a trial on Tuesday, ۲۴th Dhi 'l-Qi'dah, ۳۰۹ AH (۲۶th March, ۹۲۲ AD), during the caliphate of al-Muqtadir, because in one of his ecstasies he had cried out "I am the Truth". "al-Hallaj", says al-Hujwiri, "was the author of brilliant compositions and allegories and polished sayings in theology and jurisprudence" (op. cit., p.۱۵۱). See Ibnu 'n-Nadim, al-Fihrist, pp.۱۹۰-۲;Ibn Khallikan, op. cit., vol.I, p.۱۸۳; adh-Dhahabi, Mizanu 'l-i'tidal, vol.I, p.۵۴۸; Browne, E.G., A Literary History of Persia, vol.I, p.۴۲۸; Nicholson, R.A., A Literary History of the Arabs, p.۳۹۹.

as an extremist. In fact, the charging of this group with such attribution is not a sign of excess, since amongst those who are mentioned as learned divines and scholars, there are many who accuse the bona fide scholars of attributing less than their due to the Imams, be they from Qum or from any other country or any other people.

We have heard a narration, the meaning of which is plain, related to the authority of Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn al-Hasan ibn al-Walid"(۱), may Allah have mercy upon him, and the interpretation in favour of taqsir is inescapable. This is what is related on his authority: "The first degree of excess is to deny that the Prophet and the Imams were ever fallible (sahw)", Then if this was indeed related by him, he in fact attributes less than their due to the Imams, and yet he is one of the divines of Qum.

Moreover, we found a group of the divines of Qum who openly and firmly made this attribution in their belief, and they were degrading the Imams from their proper ranks, and alleging that they were ignorant of many of the religious ordinances until they received illumination. Also, we saw that many of them claim that they (the Imams), apply religious law according to their personal opinion and suppositions, and yet they claim that they are divines and this indeed, is attributing to the Imams less than their due.

Indeed, it is a sufficient sign of excess to claim

---

۱ - Muhammad ibn al-Hasan ibn Ahmad ibn al-Walid: He is known asAbu Ja'far al-Qummi (d. ۳۴۳ AH), was a celebrated traditionist, a jurist of high reputation and the spritual head of the Qummi divines. He was accepted by the traditionists as a trustworthy and realiable transmitter. He was the shaykh of Ibn Babawayh al-Qummi. See an-Najashi, op. cit., p.۲۷۱; at-Tusi, op. cit., p.۴۹۵; al-Mamaqani, op.cit., vol.۳, p.۱۰۰, no.۱۰۵۳۴.

that the Imams are not created beings, and that they are divine and eternal, since the only logical conclusion of this assertion is excess; that the Imams are the creators of bodies, originators of substances, and bring into existence accidents which are beyond human power. We need no more than this to judge or to ascertain their .position without the signs which Abu Ja'far, holds the marks of excess

(On Dissimulation (At–Taqiyyah .۳۴

Abu Ja'far says: "Chapter concerning at-taqiyyah"*(۱). ash- Shaykh al-Mufid adds:* Dissimulation is disguising the truth and concealing belief therein, reticence in the face of one's opponents and refraining from divulging to them that which might result in injury to one's religious or worldly welfare. It is obligatory only when injury is absolutely certain, or the presumption of it is very strong. But if it was not certain or obvious that harm would not result from disclosing the truth, nor was the presumption .strong, then dissimulation is not obligatory

The truthful ones, (the Imams), peace be upon them, have ordered a certain group of their followers not only to refrain and cease from demonstrating the truth, but also to veil and conceal it from the enemies of the religion, and to appear to them in such a way as to dispel their doubts during their disputation with them, since this was in their best interest; whereas they commanded another group of their followers to dispute with their opponents and divulge their true doctrine to them, and invite them to ,embrace the truth

---

۱- * * Not found in N.

.since they knew that no harm would befall them

Hence, dissimulation is obligatory in the cases we have put forward; whereas the .obligation is removed in other cases, as we have demonstrated above

Moreover, Abu Ja‘far has summarized the subject matter, and has not discussed it in detail as we have done. Also, he convicts himself by what he has said on the subject; since he himself has omitted an obligatory act in this respect, and stands condemned by his own words. This is so because he has disclosed his doctrine and the truth in which he believes in his famous audiences and the discussions conducted there, which were well-publicized, and his compilations which enjoyed a wide circulation; yet .he has not realized the contradiction between his words and deeds

Then, had he discussed the matter fitting- ly as should have been done, and bridled his tongue in his discussions of these things, he would have been saved from self-contradiction; then the truth would have been made plain to those who seek the truth, and they would not have been con- fronted with difficulties, nor would doubts have obscured the meaning of the subject. But he did as the traditionists do in following the apparent meaning of the words, and abandoning critical methods. This is a view which vitiates the religion of him who holds it and prevents him from achieving .fair- mindedness

(That the ancestors of the prophet were monotheists (Muwahhidun .۳۵

Abu Ja‘far says: "Our belief concerning the ancestors of the Prophet, may the blessing of Allah

be upon him and his pro- geny, is that they were Muslims".ash-Shaykh al-Mufid adds that: The ancestors of the Prophet,may the blessing of Allah be upon him and his progeny, as far as Adam, peace be upon him, were monotheists (muwahhidun) and believers in Allah, as has been demonstrated by Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, and the consensus of opinion of the adherents of the truth. Allah, the Exalted, says:

Who sees thee when thou standest, and when thou turnest about among those who prostrate themselves [۲۶:۲۱۸-۹],

which means his transmission through the loins of the monotheists. His Prophet, may the blessing of Allah be upon him and his progeny, says: "I was transmitted from the loins of the pure to the wombs of the chaste till Allah, the Exalted, brought me forth in this world of yours," which demonstrates that his ancestors were all believers, since had there been an unbeliever amongst them, then they would not merit the description 'pure', for Allah, the Exalted, says: The polytheists are indeed unclean [۹:۲۸]. Hence, He stigmatized the unbelievers are unclean. Consequently, when the Messenger of Allah, may the blessing of Allah be upon him and his progeny affirmed that his ancestors were all chaste and so described them, he confirmed that they were believers.

۳۶. Concerning the interpretation of the verse ۴۲:۴۳

Concerning the interpretation of the verse:

"Say (O Muhammad, Unto Mankind):"I Ask You No Requital Thereof

Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, says that Allah, the Exalted, has ordained a requital for

His Prophet, may the blessing of Allah be upon him and his progeny, for his apostleship and guidance of mankind's devotion to his Ahlu 'l-Bayt, peace be upon :them. Then, he adduces in evidence of this the speech of Allah

Say (O Muhammad, unto mankind): "I ask you no requital for this, save loving-.[kindness towards (my) kinsfolk" [۴۲:۲۳

ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, comments that it is not true that Allah, the Exalted, has made the requital of His Prophet men's devotion to his Ahlu 'l-Bayt, peace be upon them, nor that He made this a part of his reward. For the reward of the Prophet, may the blessing of Allah be upon him and his progeny, for his devotion to Him is perpetual grace. It is this with which Allah, the Exalted, out of His justice, generosity and bounty, has bound Himself to recompense him. For the rewarding of a deed is not owed to men as the act should be devoted sincerely to Allah alone, and that which is Allah's is to be rewarded from Allah alone, and none :save Him. Further, Allah, the Exalted, says

And, O my people! I do not ask of you wealth for this; my wage rests with Allah" .[alone" [۱۱:۲۹

:He also says

O my people! I do not ask of you a wage for this; my wage falls only upon Him Who" .[did originate me" [ibid.:۵۱

Then, if the requital was in accordance with what Abu Ja'far presumed about

the meaning of the verse, then the Qur’an would have contradicted itself, since the verse would have to be rendered like this – 'I do not ask you a wage, but I do ask of you a wage'. And also – 'My wage is with Allah alone, but rather my wage is with Allah as well as with others than Him'. And this is impossible since the text of the Qur’an .cannot bear this meaning

If then, it happened that someone said: "Then what is the meaning of 'I do not ask of you a wage for this, save loving- kindness towards (my) kinsfolk'? Does it not mean that He asked of them devotion towards his Prophet's progeny in return for what he has done for them?", then we would have to say that the facts are now what you have presumed them to be; since the proof of reason and of the Qur’an refute it, as we .demonstrated above

The exceptive (istithna’) in this particular place is not part of the main sentence because it refers to something distinct from the main clause; 'I do not ask of you a return for this, but I ask and oblige you to show devotion towards kinsfolk'. Then His speech, "I do not ask of you a return for this", is an independent sentence complete in itself; while His speech (only I demand of you) "loving-kindness towards kinsfolk" forms a new sentence signifying, "but I do ask of you devotion to (my) kinsfolk". This

:is similar to His saying

,[Then the angels bowed themselves all together, save Iblis [۱۵:۳۰-۳۱

which means, "whereas Iblis (did not)"; hence it is not an exceptive clause dependent :on the preceding. And His saying

They are an enemy to me, except the Lord of all beings [۲۶:۷۷], which means, 'but the .'Lord of all beings is not an enemy of mine

:The poet says

A land in which there is no companion, but the gazelles and the piebald camels.Then the meaning of his verse, 'A land in which there is no companion', is a self-sufficient sentence, complete in itself, while the verse, 'but the gazelles . . .' being a new sentence, means 'but there are gazelles and piebald camels in it'. This is clear and has no obscurity for anyone with any knowledge of language, and it is too well-known to .linguists to require elucidation

(On Prohibition and Permission (Al–Hazr wa 'l–Ibahah .۳۷

Abu Ja'far says, concerning prohibition and permission, that "Everything is permitted . . ."ash-Shaykh al-Mufid says: Things according to the dictates of reason fall into two categories; the first, those which are conceived as prohibited by reason, these are the things which reason abhors and admonishes against, such as injustice, foolishness and vanity. The second are those which are not defined by reason as either forbidden .('or lawful but only by textual proof (sam

This group includes deeds, the performance of which may corrupt on one occasion and be beneficial on another, and they are restricted to the rulings of canon law, which

have suffered abrogation and amendment. Since, however the religious law is settled once and for all, the general decision is that: Everything that is not prohibited by nass (i.e., the specific ordinances of religion) is permitted, because the religious canon has laid down the limits of the law, and distinguished finally what is prohibited, so it follows .logically that what lies outside their scope is permitted

(On Medicine (At-Tibb .۳۸

Abu Ja'far medicine . . ."says: "Our belief concerning the reports on ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, says: Medicine is a proper science, and a discipline approved by revelation; the scholars took their knowledge of it from the prophets. For there is no means of diagnosing illness except by textual proof, and no means of telling the remedy except by what is prescribed. Thus, it has been established that the way to know this is by textual proof (sam') from Him Who knows the secret essence of things, or by reports which have been handed down on the authority of the truthful Imams, exemplified in the saying of the Commander of the Believers, "The stomach is the seat of every disease, and diet is the principal ."medicine, so let everyone keep his body to what he is accustomed to

Also, a remedy which might prove useful to the people of one district might prove fatal to the people of another, and a medicine might benefit a people of a certain habit which would not help those of another. The truthful Imams

would prescribe for one of the sick people a medicine which proved to be harmful to others suffering from the same complaint, without harming him, since they were aware that the cause of the illness (in the first case) had ceased; so he who uses this .medicine, uses it after recovery without being conscious of this

In fact, their knowledge of this was inspired by Allah, the Almighty, in the manner of a miracle and as a supernatural proof of their distinctive status. Thus, some people presumed that when the medicine combined with the germs of the illness, it would benefit them; and this they were greatly mistaken and injured others. However, this is a consideration which Abu Ja'far has not mentioned, though it is relevant to this chapter. As for the interpretations put forward by him, they are quite sound; the .traditions may bear the meaning which he mentioned

(On the Divergent Traditions (Al –Ahadithu 'l–Mukhtalifah .۳۹

Abu Ja'far says on the divergent traditions .ash-Shaykh al-Mufid, may Allah have mercy upon him, comments that Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, did not explain the method of ascertaining which tradition is to be followed as binding precedent in jurisprudence, and which is not. In fact, he gives only a brief account of this, notwithstanding the need for a detailed examination to discriminate between what must be followed and what not, and for scrutinizing every- one of them, to tell the true tradition from the spurious, and what he has established in his summary is .insufficient

We

have discussed the divergence of the traditions and explained the difference between the sound and the spurious, the true and the false, and what is binding precedent and what is to be disregarded, and that which agrees in content, although the wording differs, and that which stems from prudent fear (at-taqiyyah) and that where the meaning is the same as that expressed. All this is set out in our books and compilations in such a way as to dispel any doubt for those who will consult them, and grace is of Allah, the Almighty. He who wants to comprehend this subject should .consult our book entitled at-Tamhid, and that entitled Masabihu 'n- nur

Also, the responses (given) to our followers throughout the world. In brief, not every tradition ascribed to the truthful Imams does, in fact, derive from them, since patent absurdities are ascribed to them (with others). Consequently, he who has not .mastered this science cannot distinguish the true from the false

Thus, different expressions have been related on their authority, of which the meanings are identical though they differ in expression. This difference is due to the fact that they deal with both the specific and the general (al-khass wa 'l-‘amm), and the supererogatory and the obligatory; so, also, some deal with particular points on which the decision cannot be applied to other cases, and still others are worded metaphorically, out of prudent fear and cautious behavior. Each of these categories ,has its own inferences and its own proofs

.and grace is of Allah, the Exalted

However, these general considerations can be elaborated when we classify the divergent traditions accurately, as we have discussed above, and determined the meaning of them in the manner we described. Thus, the false tradition, however many authorities are given for it, does not circulate as widely as the genuine which .has been related on the authority of the Imams, peace be upon them

And what has been related on their authority which is delivered out of expediency, is not related frequently on their authority like the one which is acted upon, since one of the two inevitably is given preference over the other, if the chain of the authority is scrutinized closely. Moreover, our companions have not agreed unanimously either upon what is delivered because of expediency or upon what has been adulterated (tadlis), or forged, or what has been put in their mouth falsely, or deceitfully ascribed .to them

Then, (as a general rule), when we find that one of the two traditions has been accepted as genuine and binding precedent, then it is that which is sound in both its exoteric and esoteric meanings, whereas the second one is not feasible, either .because it has been said from prudence or it has been adulterated

And, if we find a tradition related on the authority of ten of the followers of the Imams, peace be upon them, differs from another in both expression and meaning, and if it is impossible to reconcile the two, we

should prefer the one related by ten to that related by two or three authorities; and we should consider that which is sustained only by a few as being delivered from .prudence, or else that its transmitter has deluded himself

And, if we find that a particular tradition has been put into practice repeatedly by chosen companions of the Imams, peace be upon them, continuously and in the lifetime of one Imam after another, then we should inevitably prefer it to a tradition which others sustain, and which differs from it, provided that it has not been strengthened by other chains or put into practice. And, if we find a tradition related on the authority of the learned divines of the group (i.e., the Shi‘ah) and they have not testified to anything which differs from it, we consider the first to be sound; even if the latter has been related on others' authority, they are not comparable in number or distinction to the Imams, as are the first, since this (i.e., closeness to the Imams) is the .sign of veracity and the distinction between true and false

It is indeed unlikely that the Imams, peace be upon them, should deliver an opinion (responsum) dictated by prudence (at- taqiyyah) in a certain case, and that this should be heard by the learned divines among their companions without their having any knowledge of its true interpretation, since, even if this escaped one, it would not -escape all, as they were well-versed in deliver

ing response, and the limits of what is lawful and what is prohibited, what is obligatory .and what is supererogatory, and the general ordinances of religion

Above all, whenever we find a tradition differing from the text of the Book (Qur'an) and it cannot be reconciled with it, we discard it as the Book and the consensus of the Imams' dictate, and so, if we find a tradition contradicts the rules of reason, we discard it, as reason declares it corrupt; yet we judge either that it is sound and has been delivered from prudence or false and has been ascribed to the Imams, so we content ourselves with mentioning it, and admitting it in the light of the various kinds of expediency accepted as lawful by the shari'ah and that which it proscribes, or those .the current usage sanctions or denies

This is part of the general rule which has been described in detail, and which (if applied) will show the truth in divergent traditions; yet the final judgment cannot be established before specifying the divergent traditions and applying the rules appropriate in each case, as we have explained. As for the tradition which Abu Ja'far, may Allah have mercy upon him, relies on, and which has been mentioned in the book attributed to Sulaym(۱) , on the authority of Aban ibn Abi 'Ayyash, the (general) meaning of it is sound, yet none the less, the book is unauthoritative and most of it cannot be accepted as binding precedent, since it

---

۱ - Sulaym ibn Qays al-Hilali al-'Amiri al-Kufi: His kunyah was AbuSadiq. He was accused by al-Hajjaj for his Shi'ite learnings, a charge which made him go into hiding. He was a companion of 'Ali ibn Abi Talib and known as a man of piety. It is said that his face was illuminated by his piety. It is also said that he handed over the traditions entrusted to him by'Ali ibn Abi Talib to Aban ibn Abi 'Ayyash as a mark of gratitude for granting him a refuge. See at-Tusi, op. cit., p.۴۳; al-Kishshi, op. cit., p.۶۸; al-Mamaqani, .op. cit., vol.۲, p.۵۲, no.۵۱۵۷; Ibnu 'n-Nadim, op. cit., p.۲۱۹

has suffered corruption and adulteration; therefore the scrupulous should abandon all that it contains, and not rely on the greater part of it, or imitate its narrator, but enquire of the learned divines, to distinguish for him the sound from the spurious. And .Allah is He Who guides to the truth

Bibliography

.(.Abdullah, ash-shaykh, falasifatu 'sh-shi'ah, (n.p.or d'

.Al-amin, Muhsin, al-'amili, a'yanu 'sh-shi'ah, beirut, ١٣٨٠/ ١٩٦٠

.Arnold, Sir Thomas, the caliphate, oxford, ١٩٢٤

Al-ash'ari, Maqalatu 'l-islamiyyin wa ikhtilafi 'l-musallin, edited by H. Ritter, Istanbul, .(١٩٢٩ (٢ vols. with continuous pagination

AL-BAGHDADI, 'Abdu 'l-Qahir ibn Tahir, al-Farq bayna 'l-firaq wa bayana 'l-firqatu 'n-najiyah minha, edited by Muhammad Badr, Cairo, ١٩١٠. Translation of the first half of al-Firaq, under the title Muslim Schism and Sects, by Kate Chamers Seeley, Columbia University Press, ١٩١٩. Translation of the second part by Dr. Abraham S. Halkin, Tel .Aviv, ١٩٣٥

Brockelmann, C., Geschichte der arabischen Literatur, Berlin, ١٨٩٨-١٩٠٢. Arabic .translation under the title, Tarikhu 'l-adabi 'l-'Arabi, by an-Najjar, Cairo, ١٩٦٢

Geschichte der Islamischen Volker, Eng. transl., under the title, History of the -- .(Islamic Peoples, by Joel Carmichael and Mosche Perlmann, ١٩٥٩ (Fifth Impression

.Brown, E. G., A Literary History of Persia, (٤ vols), Cambridge,١٩٢٨

.(.Al-Bukhari, al-Jami'u 's-sahih, Leiden, ١٨٦٢ (٣ vols

Adh-dhahabi, Mizanu 'l-i'tidal fi naqdi 'r-rijal, new edition by 'Ali Muhammad al-.Bajjawi, Cairo, ١٣٨٢/١٩٦٢

.Donaldson, D. M., The Shi'ite Religion, London, ١٩٣٣

Ad-duri, ‘Abdu 'l-‘Aziz, Dirasat fi 'l-‘usuri 'l-‘Abbasiyyah al-muta'akh-khirah, Baghdad, ۱۹۴۵.

Encyclopaedia of Islam (E.I.):-

Article on "Buwayhids" by C. Brockelmann. Article on "Hallaj" by L. Massignon.

Article on "Isma‘il ibn Ja‘far" by C. H. Huart. Article

p: ۱۱۶

.(?) on "al-Mufid" by

FRIEDLAENDER, I., The Heterodoxies of the Shi'ites in the Presen- tation of Ibn Hazm, .New Haven, ۱۹۰۹

FYZEE, A.A.A., A Shi'ite Creed, A translation of I'tiqadatu 'l-Imamiy-yah of Muhammad ibn 'Ali ibn Babawayh al-Qummi (ash- Shaykhu 's-Saduq), published for the Islamic Research Association, India, ۱۹۴۲, Revised edition published by World Organization for .Islamic Services (WOFIS), Tehran, ۱۹۸۲/۱۴۰۲

.Gibb, H.A.R., Mohammadanism, ed., ۱۹۵۲

— .Studies on the Civilization of Islam, London, ۱۹۶۱

Goldziher, I, Vorlesungen über den Islam, Arabic translation, under the title, al-'Aqidah wa 'sh-shari'ah fi 'l-Islam, by Muhammad Yusuf Musa, 'Ali 'Abdi 'l-Qadir, .Cairo, ۱۳۷۹/۱۹۵۹

.Hasan Ibrahim Hasan, Tarikhu 'l-islami 's-siyasi, (۳ vols.), Ccairo,۱۹۵۳-۸

.Holister, J. N., The Shi'a of India, London, ۱۹۵۳

.AL-Hujwiri, Kashfu 'l-mahjub, English translation, by R. A. Nichol- son, London, ۱۹۳۶

Ibn 'abdi 'l-barr, al-Isti'ab fi ma'rifati 'l-ashab, Hyderabad, ۱۳۱۸/۱۹۰۰, and Egypt edition, .(.(۴ vols.), (n.d

.Ibnu 'l-'arabi, al-Qadi, Abu Bakr; Ahkamu 'l-Qur'an, edited by al- Bajjawi, Cairo, ۱۹۵۷-۸

.Ibnu 'l-athir, Abu 'l-Hasan 'Ali, al-Kamil fi 't-tarikh, ed. Tumgerg, Leiden, ۱۸۶۷

— .(.Usdu 'l-ghabah, Egypt, (۵ vols.), (n.d

.IBN HAJAR AL-ASQALANI, al-Isabah, Egypt, (۴ vols.), ۱۳۲۸ AH

— .Lisanu 'l-mizan, Hyderabad., ۱۳۲۹/۱۹۱۱

— .Tahdhibu 't-tahdhib, Hyderabad, ۱۳۲۵-۷/۱۹۰۷-۹

Ibn hazm, Abu Muhammad, ‘Ali ibn Ahmad, al-Fisal fi 'l-milal wa'l-ahwa’ wa 'n-nihal, (٥ vols. in two), Cairo: al-Adabiyyah, ١٣١٧-٢٠ H.

Ibn hisham, as-Sirah (an-Nabawiyyah), English translation by A.Guilaume, Oxford, ١٩٥٥.

Ibnh'l-jawzi, Abu 'l-Faraj, ‘Abdu 'r-Rahman ibn Ahmad, al- Muntazim fi tarikhi 'l-muluk wa 'l-umam, Hyderabad: Dairatu 'l- Ma‘arifi 'l-‘Uthmaniyyah, ١٣٥٨ H.

— Talbis Iblis, Cairo, ١٩٢٨.

Ibn Kathir, Abu 'l-Fida’, Isma‘il ibn ‘Umar, al-Bidayah wa 'n-nihayah, Cairo, ١٣٥١/١٩٣٢.

Ibn Khaldun, Abu Zayd, ‘Abdu 'r-Rahman

.ibn Muhammad, al- Muqaddimah, Beirut, ۱۹۰۶

.Ibn Khallikan, Abu 'l-‘Abbas Ahmad, Wafayatu 'l-a‘yan, ۱۳۱۰ H

.Ibn Manzur, Abu 'l-Fadl, Lisanu 'l-‘Arab, Beirut, ۱۹۵۵-۶

Ibnu 'L-Murtada, Ahmad ibn Yahya, al-Munyah wa 'l-amal, edited by Arnold, Sir .Thomas, Hyderabad, ۱۳۱۶ AH

Ibnu 'N-Nadim, Abu 'l-Faraj, Muhammad ibn Ya‘qub, al-Fihrist, edited by Gustav .Flügel, Leipzig, ۱۸۷۱

IBN SA‘D, Abu ‘Abdillah Muhammad, at-Tabaqatu 'l-kabir, edited byEdward Sachau, .Leiden: Brill, ۱۹۱۷

IBN SHAHRASHUB, Muhammad ibn ‘Ali al-Mazandarani, Ma‘alimu 'l-‘ulama’, edited by .‘Abbas Iqbal, Tehran, ۱۳۵۳/ ۱۹۳۴

IBN TAGHRI BIRDI, an-Nujumu 'z-zahirah fi mulük Misra wa 'l-Qahirah, Cairo, .۱۳۵۸/۱۹۰۸

IBN TAYMIYYAH, Majmu‘atu 'r-rasail wa 'l-masail, edited with notes by Muhammad .Rashid Rida, Cairo, ۱۳۴۱-۹/۱۹۲۲-۳۰

IVANOW, W., The Alleged Founder of Ismailism, (Ibnu '۱-Qaddah), Ismaili Soc., Ser. A. .I., Bombay, ۱۹۴۶

AL-JURJANI, ‘Ali ibn Muhammad, as-Sayyid ash-Sharif, Sharhu '۱- mawaqif lil ‘Allamah ‘Adudu 'd-Din ‘Abdu 'r-Rahman ibn Ahmadal-Iji, Istambul: Daru 't-Tiba‘i .'l-‘Amirah, ۱۲۹۲ H

.(.at-Ta‘rifat, (n.p.or d —

.AL-Khatib AL-BAGHDADI, Tarikh Baghdad, Cairo: al-Khanji, ۱۳۴۹/ ۱۹۳۱

AL-Khayyat, Abu 'l-Husayn, ‘Abdu 'r-Rahman ibn ‘Uthman, Kitabu'l-Intisar, edited with introduction by H. S. Nyberg, Beirut, ۱۹۵۷. AL-KHUDARI, Muhadarat fi tarikhi 'l-

umami 'l-Islamiyyah, (n.p.or d.). AL-KHWANSARI, Muhammad Baqir, Rawdatu 'l-.jannat fi ahwali 'l-‘ulama’ wa 's-sadat, Tehran, Lith. ١٣۶٧ H

AL-Kishshi, Muhammad ibn ‘Umar ibn ‘Abdi 'l-‘Aziz, Ma‘rifat akhbari'r-rijal, Bombay, .١٣١٧ AH

,AL-Kulayni, Abu Ja‘far, Muhammad ibn Ya‘qub ibn Ishaq ar-Razi

.Al-Kafi fi ‘ilmi 'd-din, new edition, Tehran, ١٣٨١ AH

.Lewis, B., The Origins of Isma'ilism, Cambridge, ١٩۴٠

AL-Majlisi, Muhammad Baqir, Biharu 'l-anwar, edited by M. H. at- Tabataba’i, Tehran, .١٣٧۶/١٩٥٧

AL-Mamaqani, Tanqihu 'l-maqal fi ahwali 'r-rijal, ٣ vols., an-Najaf

.Al-Ashraf, [Iraq], ١٣٥٢ AH

AL-Maqdisi, Mutahhar ibn Tahir, al-Bad’ wa 't-tarikh, edited by

.C.Huart, Paris, ١٨٩٩/١٩١٩

AL-Maqdisi, Shamsu 'd-Din, Ahsanu 't-taqasim fi ma'rifati 'l-aqalim, edited by De .Goeje, Leiden, ١٨٧٧

AL-Maqrizi, Taqiyyu 'd-Din, Abu 'l-'Abbas, Ahmad ibn 'Ali ibn

Abdi 'l-Qadir al-Misri al-Hanafi, Itti'azu 'l-hunafa' bi akhbari 'l- aimmati 'l-khulafa',' .edited by Jamalu 'd-Din ash-Shayyal, Cairo,١٩٤٨

.al-Khitat, Bulaq (Cairo), ١٢٧٠ AH —

AL-Maydani, Abu 'l-Fadl, Ahmad ibn Muhammad, Majma'u 'l- amthal, ٢ vols., Cairo, .١٣١٠ AH

MEZ, Adam, The Renaissance of Islam, Eng. transl., by Khuda Bukhsh and Margoliouth, London, ١٩٣٧. Arabic transl. under the title al- Hadaratu 'l-Islamiyyah fi 'l- .().qarni 'r-rabi' al-hijri, by Abu Ridah, Cairo, (n.d

AL-Mufid, Ash,shakh, Abu 'Abdillah, Muhammad ibn Muhammad ibn an-Nu'man al-Harithi, Ibnu 'l-Mu'allim, Ajwibatu 'l-masaili 's- saghaniyyah, an-Najaf al-Ashraf, al-.Hakim Library, MS. no. ٤٤٢, fol. ١٤

.al-Ikhtisas, edited by 'Ali Akbar al-Ghaffari, Tehran, ١٣٧٩ AH —

.Kitab al-Irshad, Eng. transl., by I. K. A., Howard, London, ١٩٨١ —

Muslim, Ibnu '١-Hajjaj, al-Jami'u 's-sahih, with the commentary of an-Nawawi, .Istanbul, ١٣٢٩ AH

.AN-Najashi, Abu 'Abbas, Ahmad ibn 'Ali, Kitabu 'r-Rijal, (al-Fihrist), Bombay, ١٣١٧/١٨٩٩

AN-Nawbakhti, Abu Muhammad, al-Hasan ibn Musa, Firaqu 'sh-Shi'ah, edited by H. .Ritter, Leipzig: Brockhaus, ١٩٣١

.Nicholson R. A., A Literary History of the Arabs, Cambridge, ١٩٦١

.AL-Qasimi, Jamalu 'd-Din, Mahasinu 't-ta'wil, edited by Fuad ‘Abdi'١-Baqi, Cairo, ١٩٥٧

.AR-Razi, Fakhru 'd-Din, Mafatihu 'l-ghayb (Tafsir), (٨ vols.), Cairo,١٣٠٩/١٨٩٠-١

AS-Safadi, Salahu 'd-Din, Khalil ibn Aybak ibn ‘Abdillah, al-Wafibi 'l-wafayat. Edited by .H. Ritter, Leipzig: Brockhaus, ١٩٣١

Ash-Sharastani, ‘Abdu 'l-Karim, al-Milal wa 'n-nihal, on the margin of Ibn Hazm's al-.Fisal. Also, the new edition by Ahmad Fahmi Muhammad, Cairo, ١٩٤٨

Sulayman Dunya, Muhammad ‘Abduh bayna 'l-falasifah wa 'l-mutakallimin, ,Muhammad ‘Abduh's commentary on ad-Dawani's commentary on al-Mawaqif

.of al-Iji, (۲ vols.) with continuous pagination, Cairo, ۱۳۷۷/ ۱۹۵۸

.AS-Suyuti, Jalalu 'd-Din, Tabaqatu 'l-mufassirin, Ludg. Bat., ۱۸۳۹

.Tarikhu 'l-khulafa', Delhi, ۱۳۰۹/۱۸۹۱, English translation by H. S.Jarrett, Calcutta, ۱۸۸۱ —

AT-Tabari, Abu Ja'far, Tarikhu 'r-rusul wa 'l-muluk, edited by De Goeje, Lugd. Bat., .۱۹۰۱

AT-Tahanwi, Kashshaf istilahati 'l-funun, edited by Mawlawi Muhammad Wajih, 'Abdu '۱-Haqq and Ghulam Qadir, under the superintendence of Dr. A. Sprenger and W. Less, Calicutta, ۱۸۶۲. TRITTON, A.S., Islam, Belief and Practices, Hutchinson University .Library, London,۱۹۵۷

AT-TUSI, Abu Ja'far, Muhammad ibn al-Hasan, (Shaykhu 't-Taifah), Fihrist Rijali 'sh-.Shi'ah, edited by Bahru '۱-'Ulum, an-Najaf al- Ashraf, ۱۳۸۱/۱۹۶۱

.WATT, W. M., Islamic Philosophhy and Theology, Islamic Surveys, no.l, Edinburg, ۱۹۶۲

.YAQUT AL-HAMAWI, Mu'jamu '۱-buldan, ۵ vols., Beirut, ۱۹۵۷

.(.Mu'jamu '۱-udaba', (n.p.or d —

.AZ-ZAMAKHSHARI, al-Kashshaf 'an haqaiqi 't-tanzil, Bulaq, ۱۳۱۸ AH

About center

In the name of Allah

هَلْيَسْتَوِيالَّذِينَيَعْلَمُونَوَالَّذِينَلَايَعْلَمُونَ

?Are those who know equal to those who do not know

al-Zumar: ۹

:Introduction

Ghaemiyeh Computer Research Institute of Isfahan, from ۲۰۰۷, under the authority of Ayatollah Haj SayyedHasanFaqihImami (God blesses his soul), by sincere and daily efforts of university and seminary elites and sophisticated groups began its activities .in religious, cultural and scientific fields

:Manifesto

Ghaemiyeh Computer Research Institute of Isfahan in order to facilitate and accelerate the accessibility of researchers to the books and tools of research, in the field of Islamic science, and regarding the multiplicity and dispersion of active centers in this field

and numerous and inaccessible sources by a mere scientific intention and far from any kind of social, political, tribal and personal prejudices and currents, based on performing a project in the shape of (management of produced and published works from all Shia centers) tries to provide a rich and free collection of books and research papers for the experts, and helpful contents and discussions for the educated generation and all classes of people interested in reading, with various formats in the .cyberspace

:Our Goals are

(propagating the culture and teachings of Thaqalayn (Quran and Ahlulbayt p.b.u.t-

encouraging the populace particularly the youth in investigating the religious issues-

replacing useful contents with useless ones in the cellphones, tablets and computers-

providing services for seminary and university researchers-

spreading culture study in the publich-

paving the way for the publications and authors to digitize their works-

:Policies

acting according to the legal licenses-

relationship with similar centers-

avoiding parallel working-

merely presenting scientific contents-

mentioning the sources-

.It's obvious that all the responsibilities are due to the author

:Other activities of the institute

Publication of books, booklets and other editions-

Holding book reading competitions-

Producing virtual, three dimensional exhibitions, panoramas of religious and tourism- places

.Producing animations, computer games and etc-

Launching the website with this address: www.ghaemiyeh.com-

Fabricatingdramatic and speech works-

Launching the system of answering religious, ethical and doctrinal questions-

Designing systems of accounting, media and mobile, automatic and handy systems,- web kiosks

Holding virtual educational courses for the public-

Holding virtual teacher-training courses-

Producing thousands of research software in three languages (Persian, Arabic and- English) which can be performed in computers, tablets and cellphones and available and downloadable with eight international formats: JAVA, ANDROID, EPUB, CHM, PDF, HTML, CHM, GHB on the website

Also producing four markets named "Ghaemiyeh Book Market" with Android, IOS,- WINDOWS PHONE and WINDOWS editions

:Appreciation

We would appreciate the centers, institutes, publications, authors and all honorable .friends who contributed their help and data to us to reach the holy goal we follow

:Address of the central office
Isfahan, Abdorazaq St, Haj Mohammad JafarAbadei Alley, Shahid Mohammad HasanTavakkoly Alley, Number plate ۱۲۹, first floor
Website: www.ghbook.ir
Email: Info@ghbook.ir
Central office Tel: ۰۳۱۳۴۴۹۰۱۲۵
۰۲۱ ـ Tehran Tel: ۸۸۳۱۸۷۲۲
Commerce and sale: ۰۹۱۳۲۰۰۰۱۰۹
Users' affairs: ۰۹۱۳۲۰۰۰۱۰۹

Introduction of the Center – Ghaemiyeh Digital Library